Collaborative Governance – Can it Achieve Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) Towards Independent Villages in Strategic Border Areas

Mimin Sundari Nasution¹, Zulkarnaini², Harapan Tua Simanjuntak³
¹²³Public Administration, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, University of Riau, Indonesia.
*Corresponding author, email: mimin.sundari@lecturer.unri.ac.id

Abstract

State borders are strategically important places. Because of this weakness, the border area as the country's front porch becomes a strategic issue. The border area of Indonesia, as the country's external face, is impressed if its management is based on a safety approach (safety belt method). Villages in Indonesia are still difficult to disentangle; it is frequently stated that he is lagging in development affairs, such that social, economic, infrastructure and other advances appear to be overlooked. The Village Sustainable Development Goals are a development concept that emphasizes ecologically responsible growth while also protecting local culture. The purpose of this research is to determine how the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) are implemented in the border communities of the Rokan Hilir region. A qualitative technique is used in this investigation. To acquire a thorough grasp of the research problem, data was gathered using in-depth interviews, observation, and interactive photographic techniques. Purposive sampling was used to identify informants. After collecting the data, it is processed using an analytical technique with the N-Vivo 12 to explain, show, and place the data so that conclusions can be reached. Cooperation in the three components of the SDGs is required to achieve sustainability, which balances development on the economic, social, and environmental dimensions. The study's findings indicate that the Village Sustainable Development Goals, particularly in Teluk Pulai Village in the border area of Rokan Hilir District, have not been realized based on indicators of sustainability fulfillment. Apart from that, it can be seen from the unmet SDGs performance targets, which had an impact on the Village SDGs Score of 35.96 and the Developing Village Index (IDM) with a Developing status. The SDGs goals in the border area have not been realized, including a lack of village development plans, which solely focus on satisfying the requirements of the village community, thus the SDGs Village goals required by the community are not planned.

Keywords:
sustainable development goals; border areas; development

Introduction

The Village Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) are one of the development initiatives being seriously prepared by the Indonesian government. This program adapts the notion of global SDGs, which the United Nations (UN) launched on September 25, 2015. If the global SDGs contain 17 key criteria for developing sustainable living plans, the Village SDGs provide 18 points for local adaption. To accelerate the achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals, village SDGs are an integrated effort to realize villages free of poverty and hunger, economic villages growing
evenly, health care villages, environmental care villages, education care villages, women-friendly villages, networking villages, and cultural response villages.

The concept of SDGs must be properly, consistently, and on time implemented. As a result, a thorough grasp of the region to be created is required. SDGs can only be met by localizing the values and points of each program (Servaes & Tamayo, 2017).

Villages in Indonesia, on the other hand, are still difficult to disassemble; they are frequently described as being left behind in terms of development. Various initiatives are still centred around the centre. As a result, peripheral areas such as villages with development potential are left with gaps. The village was initially perceived as a low-income neighbourhood that supported the city's activity. Instead of being used for the common good, many existing resources are exploited. This is an extremely bad condition. The reason for this is that the community has a lot of natural resources, a lot of cultural potential, and people who can be empowered (Soleh, 2017).

To assist the implementation and monitoring of the 17 Goals and 169 Targets, the SDGs in Indonesia are divided into four pillars, which differ from the three dimensions of SDGs implemented at the global level (social, environmental, and economic).

1. Social development pillars, containing points 1, 2, 3, 4, and 5;
2. Economic development pillars, including points 7, 8, 9, 10, 17;
3. Environmental development pillars, including points 6, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15;
4. Development and legal governance pillars, including point 16.

Poverty and inequality are key issues. Between 2005 and 2015, almost 6.1 million people exited poverty and extreme poverty, while the depth of poverty was dramatically reduced. However, a huge number of low-income and vulnerable people continue to be a source of concern. Although the unemployment rate is decreasing, the rate of youth unemployment is two to three times that of economic growth. Poverty reduction is a primary priority. Low-income people cannot overcome poverty merely through social security programs; they must also have adequate jobs. There will be no long-term poverty alleviation if there is no respectable work for the poor to do. Sustainable livelihoods must be expanded further through microcredit and basic infrastructure initiatives with cash-for-work schemes. New sources of growth/development that do not deplete natural resources and are environmentally benign must be created.

The population of Indonesia is expected to reach 305.7 million by the end of 2035. More than half of Indonesia's population now lives in cities. More than two-thirds of the world's population will live in cities by 2035. Some of the issues that city people will confront include sustainable infrastructure, water, energy, and food. The good news is that Indonesia has and will
continue to have a demographic advantage with a young and productive population from 2012 through 2035.

According to Regulation of the Minister of Villages, Development of Disadvantaged Regions, and Transmigration Number 13 of 2020, concerning Priorities for the Use of Village Funds in 2021, the Village SDGs include at least 18 development goals and targets, namely:

1. A Village Without Poverty
   This objective aims to eliminate rural poverty entirely by 2030. This means that there should be no poor individuals in the hamlet by 2030. Several targets must be met in villages to meet the goal of achieving zero percent poverty by 2030. As many as 100 percent of villagers have health insurance cards; 100 percent of persons with poor disabilities and women heads of households (PEKKA) receive assistance to meet basic needs; health care coverage, childbirth, and immunization, contraceptive use, access to safe drinking water, and good sanitation.

2. Hunger-Free Village
   This goal aims to eliminate hunger in the village while simultaneously establishing food sovereignty, boosting nutrition, and encouraging sustainable agriculture. This goal is consistent with Indonesia’s development priorities, which are listed as food security and job creation.

3. A Healthy and Prosperous Community
   This goal is to live a healthy life in order to achieve prosperity. As a result, villages must have easy access to health-care services.

4. Good Village Education
   The main purpose of this goal is to increase the quality of human resources (HR) in order to fulfill the goal of improving income for the rural poor. Education is essential for increasing the quality and competitiveness of village human resources (HR).

5. Village Women's Participation
   The Village SDGs Goal is to establish conditions that place all villagers in a fair position, free of gender discrimination in all spheres of life, by 2030.

6. Acceptable Village Sanitation and safe drinking water
   meeting the demands for clean water, drinking water, and sanitation is a sustainable development aim in meeting every individual’s basic rights.

7. Clean and Renewable Energy Village Energy is both an economic motivator and a necessary condition for development. The availability of sufficient and affordable energy
can help to meet basic necessities such as food, health care, and excellent education, all of which contribute to quality human development.

8. Evenly Distributed Economic Growth in Villages
The fundamental goal of this Village SDGs goal is economic growth accompanied by equitable distribution of development results, which includes establishing quality jobs and opening up new economic opportunities for all communities.

9. As Needed Village Infrastructure and Innovation
The dependability of village infrastructure, as well as the innovations that contribute to beneficial growth, go a long way.

10. A Gap-Free Village
Inequality is a measure of a region's or country's economic development that is not shared evenly by distinct welfare groups. As a result, measures to minimize inequality and inequality are critical to eradicating poverty.

11. Security and comfort are basic needs of humans, therefore to achieve village development, these two things are needed to meet the needs of the community which is expected to build participation of all parties in village development.

12. Environmentally Conscious Village Consumption and Production
This goal is related to efforts to lessen the environmental impact on the world through responsible production and consumption behaviors. Efficiency in the management of commonly held natural resources, as well as initiatives to eliminate toxic waste and pollutants, are significant priorities for achieving this goal.

13. Climate Change Response Village
To achieve national development, it is necessary to reduce the increasing impact of global climate change not just in urban areas, but also in villages.

14. Marine Environment Care Village. Protecting the coast and ocean, which in Indonesia is the center of marine biodiversity, is not only limited to maintaining the survival of ecosystems but can also provide economic and social benefits for the Indonesian population.

15. Land Environment Care Village
The Village SDGs strive to protect Indonesia's rich and diversified natural and wildlife resources in order to protect wildlife.
16. Peaceful and Just Village

One of the Village SDGs is to provide safe village circumstances and the ability of village governments to act fairly and effectively.

17. Village Development Partnership

Partnerships to fulfill these village development goals are a means of implementing and reviving village partnerships to meet all long-term development goals. Because village development will not succeed optimally unless linked parties are involved. Community leaders, village youth mobilization, women leading the local economy, universities, and the business world are all examples. Dynamic Village Institutions and Adaptive Village Culture

18. Village institutions are a very vital component to encourage sustainable development. Therefore, the existence of village institutions must be strengthened so that they can support the achievement of sustainable development goals.

Teluk Pulai Village, located near the Rokan Hilir border, is being developed in accordance with various Village and National/Global Sustainable Development Goals. Teluk Pulai Village only implements a portion of the 18 Village SDGs development goals in terms of Village Sustainable Development Goals (Village SDGs). Based on existing phenomena, this study seeks to identify and explain how the Village Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) contribute to the realization of independent villages in border areas.

"Collaboration entails a transparent and trusted communication process in which all parties feel informed and are able to provide feedback and ideas to those with whom they work." Most crucially, cooperation entails shared decision making, in which everyone understands the decision rules and all interested parties can inform or influence important decisions that may affect them, particularly resource allocation decisions.

Collaborative governance focuses on public policy and issues. Public institutions have a strong policy focus; the purpose and process of collaboration is to establish a level of consensus among stakeholders. Collaborative governance works for social justice while satisfying public importance. Collaboration, according to O’Leary and Bingham (Sudarmo, 2015) is a term that outlines the process of promoting and implementing multi-organizational solutions to challenges that cannot or are not easily solved by a single organization. This viewpoint is shared by Bardach (Sudarmo, 2015) who defines collaboration as a type of cooperative action undertaken by two or more entities with the goal of increasing "public value" rather than operating individually.

Ansell & Gash (2008) define collaborative governance as "a set of arrangements in
which one or more public institutions directly involve "non-state" stakeholders in formal, consensus-oriented, and deliberative policy-making processes aimed at creating or implementing public policies or managing public programs or assets."

Collaborative governance, according to Edward DeSeve (Sudarmo, 2015) is an integrated system with interactions handled across official and informal organizational boundaries, as well as reconceptualized organizational principles and explicit definitions of success. Furthermore, Agrawal and Lemos (Subarsono, 2011) define collaborative governance as being formed not only by the existence of "multi-partner governance" which includes the private / private sector, society, and civil society and is built on the synergy of stakeholder roles and the preparation of "hybrid" plans as well as public-private-social cooperation. Accordingly, Balogh et al in (Subarsono, 2011) define collaborative governance as a process and structure in the management and formulation of public policy decisions that involve actors who constructively come from various levels, both in government and / or public institutions, private institutions, and civil society, in order to achieve public goals that cannot be achieved if implemented by a single party.

Gaulet in Mulyadi (2015) emphasized that in order to live a good life, there are at least three major concepts in comprehending development: life sustenance, self-esteem, and independence. According to this expert perspective, the development process focuses on how individuals who are the subject of development must be able to establish a mental attitude of independence in order to assist the development process. Mulyadi (2015) defined development as an intentional effort or sequence of planned changes carried out by a nation, state, and government in the context of nation-building. Mulyadi (2015) defines development as the process of controlling state/government business (administration) in order to actualize planned growth toward a condition that is deemed better for advancement in different elements of national life. it sees development as a system with three components: a) input (values, human and natural resources, culture, and community institutions); b) processes, organizational capabilities, and government management in implementing development programs; and c) output (changes in the quality of human behaviour that has access to cognition, affection, and skills related to their standard of living).

According to Digdowiseiso (2020), development can be defined concisely as a process of change for the better that is carried out in a planned, methodical, and directed manner.

Sustainable development stresses integrated and holistic problem-solving by focusing on three pillars: social, economic, and environmental. According to Julissar (Mulyadi, 2015), numerous components of sustainable development must be considered, namely:
1. Justice and equity
2. Integrative Strategy
3. Long-Term View.
4. Environmental Sustainability.
7. Political Stability.

Like Jamaludin (2016) stated that sustainable development requires achieving sustainability in terms of:

1. Ecological: Ecological sustainability will ensure the sustainability of the earth's ecosystems. Sustainable development in the context of non-recoverable resources means efficient utilization so that it can be utilized by future generations and can be developed substitution for recovered resources and limiting environmental impact with as little use as possible.

2. Economics: For this implementation, macroeconomics is needed. Macroeconomic policy is directed at the realization of a conducive environment for business development and the opening of wide opportunities for improving the capabilities of the poor. The goal is to maintain economic stability, increase economic growth, expand employment opportunities, and reduce inequality between regions.

3. Socio-cultural: socio-cultural sustainability consists of the will to fulfill social justice, human self-esteem, improve the quality of life of all human beings, and maintain cultural diversity.

4. Politics: Political sustainability is directed at individual and social freedom to participate in the economic, social, and political fields. Therefore, a democracy that is implemented needs to pay attention to transparent and responsible democratic processes, and certainty of food, water, and settlement availability.

5. Sustainability of defense and security: sustainability of defense, such as confronting and overcoming challenges, threats, and disturbances, both from within and outside that can directly and indirectly harm the integrity, identity, continuity of the state, and nation.

Fonseca & Carvalho (2019) stated that to meet sustainability, it is necessary to achieve 3 dimensions of SDGs that balance development on economic, social, and environmental dimensions and also encourage problems such as ending world poverty to taking urgent actions to combat climate change and its impacts by 2030.
Methods

This research uses a qualitative approach with a case study method. Primary and secondary data collection with in-depth interviews, observation, and documentation techniques. Interviews were conducted with key informants using a purposive sampling method. After that, the data is analysed using N-Vivo 12 to explain, explain and place the data in their respective contexts which will be explained in words through the stages of data reduction, data display, and verification and conclusions. This study is interesting because it was analysed through the NVivo 12 Plus Application / Software to avoid subjectivity (researcher-biased), validity, and reactivity. This challenge is quite difficult to overcome if researchers analyses the data manually. Therefore, NVivo helps to separate data sourced from informants, researchers, and secondary sources (books, research reports, historical documents, journal articles, website content, online news, conference proceedings, memos, field notes, bibliographic annotations, and even researchers’ daily journals stored in NVivo). NVivo ensures that data is sourced from the field. Where the locus of this research was conducted in Teluk Pulau village, Pasir Limau Kapas District, Rokan Hilir Regency, Riau Province, Indonesia. Given that this village is a village that has a developed IDM that is much better than the village IDM in the sub-district of pasir limau kappas itself and has the potential for development of various economic and social aspects and with better SDGs score conditions than other villages.

Results and Discussion

The implementation of village development activities prioritizes the utilization of human resources and natural resources in the village and uses self-help and community cooperation. From the implementation of this development, a government effort is needed to ensure the sustainability of limited resources. Therefore, the government tries to carry out development by using resources effectively and efficiently. Sustainable development is an effort from the government so that this can be achieved.

Sustainable development is a development concept that prioritizes environmentally friendly development and respects the culture and interests of local communities. This concept is global in terms of development. In response, the United Nations (UN) set Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) as the answer. Then the Ministry of Villages, Development of Disadvantaged Regions and Transmigration (Kemendes PDTT) localized global SDGs into the context of village Village SDGs by Permendesa PDTT No. 13/2020 concerning the priority of using village funds 2021. Village SDGs have 18 sustainable development goals that have been adapted to village conditions in Indonesia.
From the overview of 18 sustainable development goals in Teluk Pulai village, the highest SDGs score is in goal 7, namely clean and renewable energy villages with a score of 99.10, while for some other SDGs goals, some are still zero.

### a. Economic Dimension

The economic dimension is one of the dimensions in the implementation of SDGs. In national development priorities, the economic dimension target is not much different from the SDGs target or Village SDGs. Accelerating national economic growth, increasing labour competitiveness, building national connectivity, and equitable development between regions, all of these are the same priorities between national development and SDGs. The goals of Village SDGs that have elements of economic development in them are goals 1, 2, 7, 8, and 10. Economic achievement in sustainable development intends to reduce extreme poverty, eliminate the gap between poor and rich groups, reduce food consumption inadequacy, ensure access to electricity, create new job opportunities, and provide greater economic security for all.
Economic growth accompanied by equitable distribution of development results is the main target of this Village SDGs goal. Among them by creating decent jobs, and opening up new economic opportunities for all villagers. Indicators of success goals include the absorption of the labour force with employment, the implementation of village labour intensive by being able to absorb 50 percent of the village labour force, workplaces that provide a sense of security and are equipped with health care facilities.
Development in Teluk Pulai village only touches a little on the issue of improving the village economy as evidenced by the absence of scores or Village SDGs scores in the SID of the Ministry of Villages. The value listed on the SID is N/A (Not Applicable) which explains that the SID system cannot read and assess village programs in realizing the goals of Village SDGs. Several other Village SDGs goals also bring up N/A scores as in goal 12. The N/A score does not mean that the village failed in realizing the SDGs goals, if it fails then the score listed is 0 as in goals 9, 12, 13, and 17.

![Figure 4. Percentage Land Status of the House](source)

Source: Processed Researchers, 2023

The increase in number of people in Teluk Pulai village is increasing over the years, causing an increase in land needs to meet the needs of food, work, infrastructure, and housing. This means that development must continue to adapt to changing socioeconomic changes. Therefore, every sustainable development program and activity must be able to achieve or even exceed the target of economic goals. Various ways have been done by the government to answer these problems, but due to geographical conditions and a large number of people’s needs in Indonesia, this aspect is not fully realized. As in Teluk Pulau Village, there are still worker services whose pay is not comparable to the necessities of life.

b. Environmental Dimensions

In carrying out sustainable development, there needs to be an understanding of the importance of natural resource economics and ecological economics. Understanding the concept of ecosystem conservation is an element of achieving a quality of life for current and future generations which is the goal of sustainable development itself. The concept of early prevention, biological and non-biological protection is the main principle of ecologically sound sustainable development. These principles are key targets of sustainable development due to the large
dependence of humans on environmental ecosystems. Therefore, to see the success and achievement of sustainable development can be seen from how development in a country or region in ecological achievements. Village SDGs also emphasize how development carried out by villages must pay attention to environmental ecosystem aspects such as goals 6, 7, 9, 11, 12, 13, 14, and 15.

The goals of Village SDGs in realizing sustainable development with ecological elements are by national development priorities in the environmental pillar. Water security, the development of safe and comfortable residential areas, and the preservation of natural resources and the environment are some of the priority targets of national development in line with the goals of Village SDGs in ecological achievement. [9] said that several things must be done to meet ecological achievements need: (1) maintain the integrity of the environmental order so that the life support system on earth remains guaranteed; (2) three aspects that must be considered to maintain the integrity of the environmental order, namely carrying capacity, assimilative capacity, and sustainable use of recovered resources; (3) carry out activities that use sustainable management principles. Development in Teluk Pulai village that concerns ecological achievements in its implementation is assistance for village road construction and assistance for clean water sources.

![Figure 5. Percentage of family landfills](image)

*Source: Processed Researchers, 2023*

Development usually has a short target period so that government tools pursue targets by exploiting existing resources to increase economic growth, such as logging forests for export and generating financial income in a short time. This problem is answered by SDGs and Village SDGs because, in the framework of development, this is sustainable which means that development has
a long target period. The programs and activities carried out are also well planned and pay
attention to the nature of sustainability such as applying ecological achievements in development.
Ecological achievements are used to maintain existing resources so that they can be used
sustainably, and can even generate economic benefits if you look more closely at the potential
that exists in these resources.

Data from the Central Statistics Agency (BPS) in 2020 states that the achievement of access
to decent clean water in Indonesia currently reaches 72.55% with a range of 33.4 million people
lacking clean water and 99.7 million people lacking access to good sanitation facilities. This figure
is still below the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) target, which is 100% of all residents get
access to clean water.

c. Social Dimensions

A development generally tends to prioritize the physical and visual aspects of a spatial
layout and environment. Aspects related to community (social) planning and resource planning
still do not receive the proper portion of attention. The beginning of development is only seen
from the economic meaning so the environmental and socio-cultural meanings are left behind.
The development emphasizes aspects of human values, such as supporting survival or the ability
to meet needs. Development in achieving social aspects can be seen through the distribution of
prosperity through equitable access to socio-economic resources, such as education, health,
housing, clean water, recreational facilities, and participation in political decision-making
processes, as well as raising the spirit of nationality and nationalism.

SDGs have aspects of social development as in the goals of Village SDGs 1, 2, 3, 4, and 5, as
well as the pillars of national development which have socio-cultural priorities in overcoming
poverty, improving community welfare, increasing food sovereignty, implementing smart and
healthy Indonesia programs, and protecting children, women and marginalized groups. Some of
the goals of socio-cultural achievements are to maintain population stability, meet basic human
needs, maintain cultural diversity, and make the nation-state a developed and modern society
without losing its identity. The social dimension has several problems and obstacles in its
application such as cultural elements that must be maintained, but on the other hand, the nation
concerned must be ready to accept the changes demanded by modern life. For this reason,
sustainable development is required to find a balance between modern aspects and cultural
wisdom to realize social achievements. In realizing Village SDGs, development in Teluk Pulai
Village which includes social dimensions is assisted as follows.
The existence of intersections of border locations with Strategic Areas such as 3T can actually be an effort to accelerate the development of Border Areas. There is already a policy of Presidential Regulation number 105 of 2021 concerning the National Strategy for the Acceleration of Development of Disadvantaged Regions so that programs / activities for the development of Border Areas in disadvantaged areas can be mapped. Efforts to improve the welfare of people in border areas require collaboration of various parties, both for the implementation of activities and funding. The location of the Border Area also intersects with the location of the Government Strengthening and Village Development Program (P3PD) which can be synergized for intervention. In the future, it is hoped that the target index of achievement in improving welfare in the Border Area can be achieved. Increasing the participation of village governments and communities in defense and security at state borders is important and fundamental because it is the front porch of the country.

Conclusion

Development carried out in Teluk Pulai village is seen based on the dimensions of sustainable development, namely economic, social, and environmental dimensions that have not been able to realize the goals of the Village Sustainable Development Goals. Teluk Pulai Village only implements 14 of the 18 Village SDGs goals with a score of 35.96 where the highest goal is found in the 7th Village SDGs (Clean and Renewable Energy Village) with a score of 99.10.
References


Peraturan Menteri Desa PDTT RI No 13 Tahun 2020 tentang Prioritas Pemanfaatan Desa


Peraturan Menteri Desa, PDT, dan Transmigrasi No 13/2020 tentang Prioritas Penggunaan Dana Desa Tahun 2020