Co-Production of the Provision of Public Goods by the Community
in Darungan Village, Jember Regency

Supranoto¹, Mohammad Baladdudin Dayar², Faiqoh³

¹Public Administration, Faculty Social and Political Science, The Universitas Jember
²Public Administration, Faculty Social and Political Science, The Universitas Moch. Sroedji, Jember
³Public Administration, Faculty Social and Political Science, The Universitas Moch. Sroedji, Jember
(email: 89dayar@gmail.com)

Abstract

This paper is the development of research that examines the long experience of Darungan Village, Jember Regency in providing public goods in the form of clean water for its citizens. The study was conducted from the institutional perspective of the Ostrom (1980) and Bromley (1989) model and focused on a) the role of the parties, particularly the government and society, in co-production institutions, and b) the challenges and obstacles faced. The research was conducted using a descriptive qualitative approach, involving some informants from both the community and village government to the district government. All informants were selected on the basis that they knew the process being studied due to their direct involvement. Primary data were collected using in-depth interviews, participatory observation, and focus group discussions. Secondary data was collected by the document study method. All data were tested for validity by triangulation of sources and methods before being analyzed by an interactive analysis model. Research finds that co-production institutions in the provision of clean water experience various obstacles in line with the ups and downs of the government’s role.

Keywords
cooproduction; institutional perspective; Darungan village

Introduction

Darungan Village, Tanggul District, Jember Regency, is a village where the community experiences the problem of scarcity of public goods in the form of clean water. To be able to get water, some people have to travel several kilometers using simple equipment in the form of jerry cans that can carry up to six liters of water capacity for them to use to meet their main needs such as cooking and religious purposes. Some other communities use clean water supply services that are managed independently by the community known as HIPPAM (Independent Water Supply Association) and several other water supply alternatives such as PDAM. The variety of alternative water supply, ranging from individuals to self-help and government provision services, is due to the high topographical conditions of this village so
access to water sources is difficult for the community to reach. This village is right under the slopes of Mount Argopuro with a height of 153 m above sea level with an area of 22.11 km. It is the tallest and widest village in Tanggul District. The area of this village covers 20% of the Tanggul sub-district. More complete data can be seen in the table below:

Table 1. Altitude, area, and distance from the village office to the sub-district office

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Village</th>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Large (Km2)</th>
<th>Percentage of sub-district area</th>
<th>The distance from the village office to the sub-district office</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 West Tanggul</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>8,16</td>
<td>7.62</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 East Tanggul</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>7,91</td>
<td>7.38</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Klatakan</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>16,54</td>
<td>15.44</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Selodakon</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>6,56</td>
<td>6.12</td>
<td>8.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Darungan</td>
<td>153</td>
<td>22,11</td>
<td>20.64</td>
<td>7.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Manggisan</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>19,49</td>
<td>18.19</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Patemon</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>11,11</td>
<td>10.37</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Kramat Sukoharjo</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>15,26</td>
<td>14.24</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tanggul Sub District</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>10,714</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: BPS Jember (2019)

Based on information from local community leaders, during the period from Indonesia’s independence until the early 2000s, how suffering the condition of the people of Darungan Village, with most of them being below the poverty line, low level of education to unhealthy behavior. This resulted in the basic needs of citizens in the form of access to clean water at that time was very difficult to obtain. They have to walk several kilometers with simple equipment to carry water, for people who do not realize the importance of clean water because their level of understanding and education is low. Some use ditch water to meet their needs, and as a result in this village there has been a case of El Tor, which is a type of cholera disease. Caused by poor sanitation in the community. Although this case is no longer the case, until now the education level of the people in Darungan Village is still relatively low, based on the latest data, the average education level of the people of Darungan Village is elementary school graduates. This data can be seen in the table below:
Table 2.

Educational Background of Darungan Village Community

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The educational background of the Darungan Village community</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Bachelor and Magister</td>
<td>53  people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Senior High School</td>
<td>1,342 people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Junior High School</td>
<td>2,428 people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Elementary School</td>
<td>3,687 people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Didn’t Pass Elementary School</td>
<td>3,799 people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f. Not Going to School</td>
<td>1,774 people</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Darungan Village RPJM December 2016-2021

Based on the data above, it shows that most of the productive age graduates of the Darungan Village community are 3,799 people who have not finished elementary school, followed by SD/MI graduates. This indicates that the quantity and quality of public education are very low when referring to the government’s twelve-year compulsory education program. However, this village community has its uniqueness, namely, even though the level of formal education is low, most of the community has a tradition to study informal education in Islamic boarding schools. The perspective of the local community believes that formal education is not as important as religious education so that essentially this village community does not reflect a portrait of an uneducated community, only that it is more concerned with religion-based informal education or the severity of the problems faced by the community resulting in the neglect of the need to access education.

The picture of water scarcity, poverty, isolation and low education in Darungan Village is an accumulation of the result of the absence of the state to solve public problems. The portrait of the problems that occur in this village can become an iceberg phenomenon which later if a wider study is carried out will show that in Indonesia there are still many villages that are neglected by the state, even though the government has various strategies and programs for villages, but in reality there are still many untouched spaces. As mandated by the Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia No. 33 Paragraph 1 that “Earth and water and the natural resources contained therein are controlled by the state and used for the greatest prosperity of the people.” The fact that happened in Darungan Village shows that water as a public good in the public sector has not been touched by state intervention where the role of the state should be needed to intervene in the interests of water management and water resources for the benefit of the community.
The description of the phenomenon of a village experiencing isolation and difficulty in accessing clean water needs because for decades the government has not been present strengthens the anxiety of administrative scholars. As the opinion of Thomas and Alford (2021) that there are bureaucratic diseases that have been haunting public administration, especially in matters of the public sector, where the government is considered inefficient, unresponsive, wasteful and many other administrative ailments. Because of this unrest in the 1980s several administrative scholars tried to introduce reforms. One of them is to focus on reforms on the supply side of goods and services. Some argue that in order for the government to run services to be effective and efficient, the mechanism is left to public sector organizations by applying market values. Others focus more on government programs by giving roles to non-profit organizations which are also known by various terms, namely the third sector, community sector, non-profit sector, volunteer sector and other terms that are related to the role of society. This idea has its roots in the synthesis of the New Public Management and Old Public Administration Paradigms in the form of Osborne's (2010) New Public Governance paradigm.

Based on the Decree of the Regent of Jember No. 10 of 2021, the Jember Regency Government through the Public Works Department of Cipta Karya has implemented a clean water facility assistance program in collaboration with the community through the non-profit organization HIPPAM Al Barokah. The first aid received began in 2000 in the form of clean water distribution facilities. Until now, the coverage of HIPPAM services is in the inter-village area. HIPPAM Al Barokah services cover 2 villages, namely Darungan Village which includes 4 Hamlets namely Krajan Hamlet, Sumber Bulus Hamlet, Jumbatan Hamlet, and Gondang Hamlet with 202 Family Heads receiving the service. and Manggisan Village includes four hamlets, namely Sungai Tengah Hamlet, Koloran Hamlet, Binong Hamlet, Tegalan Hamlet with 500 families so that the total services provided by HIPPAM are 702 families. The length of the water channel available from the water source center at the beginning of the establishment of HIPPAM was 2 kilometers which gradually continued to grow to 7 kilometers. This is because there is an increasing number of public consumers who enjoy this service. With the clean water supply service carried out by HIPPAM, villagers can enjoy access to clean water as they should.
The idea of involving the public sector in the provision of public goods in Darungan Village was an idea that was first pioneered by an economist who also conducted research in the public sector, namely Elinor Ostrom in the 1970s. The basic idea is how to give dual roles to consumers. Consumers who have been playing a passive role are also given a dual role as producers, this term is then known as producer-consumer. Ostrom’s ideas were later attracted by other public administration scientists and also received criticism and contributions for a clearer definition by Alford, Pestoff and Brandsen. Alford (2013) argues that the initial definition of Ostrom is too narrow and simplistic, while Pestoff and Brandsen (2018) make the definition in order to avoid overlapping definitions of co-production that have been developed in various multi-disciplinary science disciplines, another goal is to accumulate the contributions of this research. The essence of Brandsen’s idea of co-production is the joint role between government and society in the process of implementing public services and public policies. This study wants to describe the co-production process that occurs in Darungan Village as well as the theoretical challenges in the development of public administration disciplines.

Methods

The research method used in this study is descriptive qualitative as according to Creswell (2019, p.4) “Qualitative research begins with assumptions and the use of theoretical interpretation frameworks that shape or influence the study of research problems related to the meanings imposed by individuals or groups on a social or human problem. To study this problem, qualitative researchers use the latest qualitative approaches in research, data collection in the natural environment that is sensitive to the community and research site, and inductive and deductive data analysis and the formation of various patterns or themes. The final written report or presentation includes the voices of the participants, the reflexivity of the researcher, the description and interpretation of the research problem, and its contribution to the literature or calls for change.” The research subject is the community that plays a role in the provision of public services to meet the needs of clean water. This research was conducted for 11 months starting in April 2021 until March 2022, which is located in Darungan Village, Tanggul District, Jember Regency. Data collection techniques were carried out using in-depth interviews, participatory observation, and documentation. The data presented has
been tested for validity using the degree of data validation, including extending participation, persistence and constancy of observation, triangulation of data sources and triangulation of method sources, peer checking through discussion, referential adequacy, member checking and detailed descriptions. Data presentation using interactive data analysis method Miles and Hubermann (2014).

**Result and Discussion**

**Public Goods and Private Goods and How They Are Provided**

The difference between public goods and private goods can at least be distinguished based on the nature of their use. Private goods have individual utility properties, while public goods have shared utility properties (Thomas & Alford, 2021). Water Resources in Darungan Village have a circle of interest in the use of various sectors, including the government sector, the private sector and the social or community sector, the use of water should be included in the category of public goods but based on the nature of its use, water can be a public good as well as a private good.

According to experts, the provision of public goods has various alternatives, including individual use grouped into private goods and public swimming pool items. This can "easily" prevent people from enjoying it for free. Shared use is grouped into toll goods and collective goods. It must use the "letter" Prevent people who want to enjoy it for free. Sources are obtained from modifications (Safas: 1987) quoted from Mr. Supranoto (Supranoto: 2022). Another opinion, according to Savas, there are four alternatives, the first is private good, the use of consumption individually, this makes it easier to prevent everyone from enjoying the second free Toll Good consumption together and also makes it easier to prevent everyone from using the third common pool good for consumption individually and also difficult to prevent other people enjoy for free and the fourth collective public good is consumption together and it is difficult to prevent others from enjoying it for free (Savas, 1987) Another opinion and this is the focus of discussion in this study, namely the idea of providing public goods that are provided jointly by the government and society through community participation and giving multiple roles in the provision of public goods this idea was pioneered by Ostrom (1980) and continues to be developed by other scholars such as Pestoff (2003), Brandsend (2010) and Alford (2013).
Co-Production of the Provision of Public Goods by the Community

Based on the results of the study, the researcher identified the co-production process occurring in the clean water supply service in Darungan Village, with the joint role of the actors in providing this public good to the community as the concept of the co-production mechanism below.

Picture 1.
Typology of co-producing actors according to Thomas & Alford (2021)

In the following explanation, the researcher will explain who the actors in the co-production process are in the process of providing clean water services in Darungan Village and what their roles are so that there is a joint role between several elements, namely the government, professional personnel and the community. Figure 1.1 shows that there is a direct and indirect co-production process.

a. Third-Party Providers

The third party in the context of this research is defined as a private party or contractor who is mandated to carry out a facility construction project which is then handed over to the beneficiary community group which will later be managed independently. Based on the findings of researchers in Darungan Village, the construction of clean
water storage and distribution facilities was carried out twice, namely in 2000 and 2011 which was located in plot 22 B KHDP Darungan and the second location was in plot 22 F KHPD Manggisan. The location of the springs is moved because the production of the springs is no longer sufficient to meet the demand for the supply of public consumers because the number of service recipients is increasing.

b. Public Works Department creates works

Representational actors from public sector organizations in charge of preparing material for policy formulation, provision, implementation, supervision, data collection and control in the management of SPAM (Drinking Water Supply System).

In general, the SOP (Standard Operational Implementation) carried out by the PU Cipta Karya in carrying out verification of SPAM beneficiaries goes through the following stages. First, information or data on requests for assistance can be obtained through the results of the musrembang or direct requests through proposals from the community. Then the incoming demand data is processed and selected by the SIE for Drinking Water Supply which is then submitted to the head of the field, after being submitted to the field, it is submitted to the head of the service to be submitted to the budget team. After getting a budget decision, then the list of requests for assistance will be implemented.

c. Suppliers and Consumers

Suppliers and Consumer are representation from the community sector, represented by the non-profit organization HIPPAM Al Barokah. The task of this organization is to ensure that water services to the community run well, starting from the implementation process which includes data collection and socialization, installation of facilities, internal management meetings and external members, collection of fees and facility repairs, network expansion to submissions to the government. The thing that shows that HIPPAM is a community organization that represents active community participation can be seen when carrying out these services the officers blend into the service recipient community, it can be seen that the value of the interests of the people is at the core of public services by prioritizing the value of cooperation and cross subsidies or intervention to recipients. services unable to make full payment.
Challenges Faced by Community Sector Organizations in the Development of Public Administration

What the researchers have explained about the service to meet the needs of clean water and the challenges faced in Darungan Village, which is carried out by HIPPM Al-Barokah where this organization researchers categorize based on the opinions of experts such as Brandsend & Pestoff (2010), Thomas & Alford (2021) as a third sector organization, ultimately requires a holistic assessment in the perspective of public administration. Referring to the purpose of the establishment of this discipline, public administration appears to specifically explain how government administration is carried out using an approach to organizational and management principles (Waldo, 1986), (Supranoto, 2022), trying to separate themselves from politics and administration (Supranoto, 2022). Wilson, 1887). So according to the researcher, to make an assessment of the case study that occurred in Darungan Village requires a perspective that is different from the classical approach, because the subject in this study is the community not the government as the classic goal of this scientific discipline was established.

The goal is for the public, using the value of democratization in collaboration or assisting the government's role in meeting public needs. This idea emerged from the debate process of public administration experts such as Wilson, Frederickson (1980), Ostrom (1990), Brudney & England (1983), Brandsen (2018), Thomas & Alford (2021) which essentially focuses on the implementation of classical administration in the public sector. There is a troubling historical experience in which public services managed by the state are seen as inefficient, unresponsive, and wasteful, and there are many other images of depravity which are also known as diseases that gnaw at public administration. If you compare it with the facts that the researchers found in Darungan Village, this is in accordance with the classic picture of unrest and depravity in public sector services managed by the government. Referring to this case, since Indonesia's independence, rural communities have had difficulty getting access to clean water, which is essentially a citizen's right to get water properly, the real effort of the government's presence could only be identified by researchers in the early 1990s. This presence can be said to be very long, it took almost half a century to realize the presence of the state but it is better than nothing. Because of these considerations, there is an idea to
involve the community, through active and passive participation in the hope of overcoming the diseases that are eating away at the public sector that is intervened by the government.

The presence of the government through Perhutani and the Public Works Department of Cipta Karya, researchers see as an effort by the government to reform institutions that have direct links to the interests of this sector, especially in the management of clean water supply by providing space for public participation. Perhutani, has an interest in maintaining and conserving the forest in the area which has begun to experience deforestation due to illegal logging by local communities. This logging is carried out by the community because of economic needs as a result of the conditions of poverty that occur in the community, it could also be due to irresponsible behavior and lack of awareness of the importance of protecting nature and shared resources from damage, this factor is due to the low level of public education and the anthropocent perspective in utilization of natural resources so that water resources and natural resources of the state are considered as commodities that can be exploited at any time for the benefit of humans. Based on these considerations, Perhutani through its representatives, namely the forest administrator also known as ADM, negotiated with representatives of community leaders to preserve the forest by providing facilities and permits to manage clean water facilities through the use of springs in the Forest Institute area with compensation so that the community does not illegal logging. The assistance for water channel facilities and permits for the use of springs in the Forest Institute area to be managed by the people from Forest Institute is known as the white pipe. In subsequent developments, there are many obstacles in managing this assistance, one of the obstacles faced by the community is the destruction of aid facilities and the worsening water quality as a result of the mismanagement of this assistance, due to the limited knowledge of the community, water flowing from Forest Institute springs is mixed with rice fields. The goal is to increase the flow of water supply, but the bad result is poor and polluted water quality. Another problem is that Forest Institute cannot provide assistance on a regular basis or at least help maintain facilities because Forest Institute does not have the direct authority to deal with water supply problems, and this problem is actually not Forest Institute business. The assistance provided by Forest Institute has a background in the agreement between Forest Institute interests in protecting the forest from illegal logging which during this period was often carried out by the community.
As per the prevailing laws and regulations, the owner of the authority in the matter of providing clean water is the Public Works Department of Cipta Karya, Jember Regency, the drinking water supply division. In this case, the service provides assistance for clean water facilities based on the results of the Development Plan Deliberation data and other supporting data, or based on consideration of certain criteria such as villages that are considered to have a good foundation of institutional structure, especially in terms of clean water management. These special criteria aim that the assistance provided by the government to be managed by the community itself can last a long time, provide benefits and sustainability. Darungan Village has reliable institutional criteria in water management, this can be seen from the efforts of community leaders to bring in government actors so that the initial pioneering of water resource management can be realized. The embryo of the presence of government assistance is the transformation of community groups into a non-profit organization known as HIPPAM (Association of Residents of Drinking Water Users). The first aid received by HIPPAM through the Public Works Department of Cipta Karya, Jember Regency was in 2000. Furthermore, the assistance gradually continued to develop according to the needs and requests submitted by HIPPAM to the relevant agencies, but the assistance submitted did not always get approval and realization due to various considerations. And political decisions taken by policy makers at the regional level.

The picture that the researcher can explain in this case is that the government’s efforts to provide assistance with the aim of being managed independently by the community provide a space for democratization to the community in the context of developing country communities, with characteristics of isolation or remoteness seen from inadequate infrastructure, level of formal education The low level can be seen from the majority of elementary school graduates, poverty and high unemployment can be seen from the majority of the population working as migrant workers. It also has a fundamental weakness because the pattern of public service governance that occurs in the field is far from the principles and values of state administration as implemented by the government. for example, the characteristics of professional public services according to the ideas of Gullick (1937) in a paper entitled The Early of Management and Organization known through the acronym POSDCORB which includes Planning, Organizing, Staffing, Directing, Coordinating, Directing, Reporting and Budgeting. The class community in developing countries does not
recognize this term in the implementation of public services, referring to the implementation of clean water services in the previous subchapter, it can be seen that the points that are not implemented by service providers are the lack of coordination, reporting and accountable budgeting. Based on these considerations, the joint role between the community and the government is questioned by the failure or not to carry out this managerial principle transformation process, so it can be concluded that the services provided by HIPPAM as a representation of the cooperation between the community and the government run unprofessionally.

On the positive side, democratization has a place with the dominance of the role of the community in public service governance, besides that it is also effective, efficient and economical and socially just as the idea of Frederickson (1980) in the new public administration paradigm. That the concerns that public administration experienced in the 70s and 80s with the assumption that public administration was run ineffectively, efficiently and with social justice, in this case can be answered as an attempt to cut the compass to realize an effective, efficient and socially just government. Researchers can find this answer by providing a space for democratization through participation in public service governance. Effective means that the assistance for clean water storage and distribution facilities provided by the Public Works Cipta Karya Office of Jember Regency to community representatives is very appropriate to provide the benefits of easier access to clean water in meeting daily water needs. Although there are records about the quality of water used by the community for daily consumption, it must be re-tested because it is indicated that it is contaminated by bacteria. Efficient means providing a better service with the available resources. Based on the consideration of the remote geographical location, building clean water facilities has an efficiency and economic value than offices located in the center of the district government providing services directly through the relevant officers. The availability of sources of public goods based on the proximity of the location allows the community to play a role in the provision of clean water services.

Social justice is an additional rationale that becomes the spirit in a public service process. Another term is social equity as argued by Frederickson (1980) that social justice means an emphasis on equal rights in government services, responsibility for decisions or programs taken by policy makers, changes in public management, more responsiveness to the
community than public organizations, and an interdisciplinary approach. Based on the cases that occurred in this study, the rights of citizens to enjoy their basic needs in meeting their water needs have experienced inequality due to their geographical location, as a result, the people in Darungan Village cannot enjoy the services that urban communities receive through public organizations such as PDAM which represents the government in water supply clean. Because of these considerations, a change in management was made from what was originally managed purely by the government as the owner of the authority to shift to governance carried out by the community through a joint role with the government. This idea adopts an interdisciplinary approach to economics known as co-production by giving citizens a dual role as consumer-producer, citizens are given the opportunity to act as their own service provider while they also enjoy their services.

Conclusion

Based on this research, it can be concluded that the birth of the idea of co-production is one form of manifestation of democratization in the process of providing public services to the community. Co-production focuses on the role of the community sector in providing services to the community, the hope is to provide space for the community to actively participate from design to implementation of a public service. What the Al Barokah HIPPAM organization did in Darungan Village is a manifestation of the presence of a form of community sector participation in providing water services to the people of Darungan Village. However, involving the third sector in public services up to now has challenges that must be faced, such as its implementation does not meet professional principles and the application of management values is still weak.

References


Kbbi Daring. (t.t.). kbbi.kembidbud.go.id/Beranda


RPJM Desa Darungan Kecamatan Tanggul Kabupaten Jember Propinsi Jawa Timur Tahun 2016-2021 (2016)


Savoie, D. J. (1995) *Whats is wrong with the new public management?* Canadian Public administration. Vol.38 No.1 Hlm. 112-121.


Undang-Undang Sumber Daya Air No.7 (2004). https://www.google.com/search?q=UndangUndang+Sumber+Daya+Air+No.7+(2004).&rlz=1C1CHWL_enUS934US934&oq=UndangUndang+Sumber+Daya+Air+No.7+(2004).&aq=chrome..69i57j0i22i30l2.1224j0j4&sourceid=chrome&ie=UTF-8

Undang-Undang Otonomi Daerah No.32 (2004). https://www.google.com/search?q=UndangUndang+Otonomi+Daerah+No.32+%282004%29.&rlz=1C1CHWL_enUS934US934&sxsrf=ALiCzsb4YaXs7p9PScAxWLCBVPyB_TtSU%3A1656298052427&ei=RBq5YtzSGful9u8Ph-ec4Ag&ved=0ahUKEwjchLqIz8z4AhV7hP0HYczB4wQ4dUDCA0&uact=5&oq=UndangUndang+Otonomi+Daerah+No.32+%282004%29.&gs_lcp=Cgdnd3Mtd2l6EAMyBggAEB4QFjlgCAAQHhHAWugQIgRgAsQgQIRhguAbYAGIDd2gAcAF4AIAbsQWIAbEFkgEDNS0xMAEa0AECoAEwAEwAE&wiz

Undang-Undang Desa No.6 (2014). https://www.jogloabang.com/pustaka/uu-6-2014-desa

Peraturan Bupati Jember Nomor 10 Tahun 2021 Tentang Kedudukan, Susunan Organisasi, Tugas dan Fungsi Serta Tata Kerja Dinas Perumahan Rakyat, Kawasan Permukiman Dan Cipta Karya Kabupaten Jember.


