

From Local to Global: Transformation of the Indonesian Civil Service through Public Administration Reform

Marlan Hutahaean

Universitas HKBP Nommensen, Medan, Indonesia. (email: marlan.hutahaean@uhn.ac.id)

Abstract

Public administration reform is the Indonesian government's strategy to increase the capacity of the Indonesian Civil Service (ICS) to be able to compete at the global level. This article reveals the approach that has been taken so far and the development model for increasing ICS capacity so that they are able to compete globally. The main problem with Indonesian ICS is the lack of ability to compete internationally, especially ICS in local government. In fact, for a region to progress, one of the requirements is that its ICS competency must be qualified, not only local, but global. By using a descriptive qualitative approach, researchers found that the public administration reforms carried out so far in Indonesia are more about bureaucratic reform. Public administration reform is very broad, covering various dimensions. Bureaucracy is only one of the various dimensions of public administration that exist, such as public policy, public management, public organizations, public ethics, public environment, and performance. For this reason, it is necessary to reform public administration as a whole, through the development of a model that is able to increase the competence of Indonesian ICS at international standards.

Keywords:

Indonesian civil service; public administration reform; international competence

Introduction

Globalization has changed many aspects of life, including the way governments around the world operate. In the context of public administration, globalization requires state civil servants (ICS) to have competencies that not only apply at the local or national level, but also at the international level. Friedman (2005) in his book "The World is Flat" explains that globalization creates a world that is more closely connected, where geographical boundaries become increasingly irrelevant in economic, cultural and political contexts. This requires ICS to have a broader understanding of global dynamics in order to work effectively in an increasingly complex and integrated environment (Friedman, 2005).

Increasing international linkages, ICS must have the ability to interact and collaborate with various global stakeholders. These competencies include the ability to communicate effectively, understand international laws and norms, and strong negotiation skills. The study by Verheijen et al. (2022) emphasize that ICSs need to develop a better understanding of how global

policies can be integrated into national policies to strengthen inclusive and fair governance. Furthermore, Yip (2022) in his discussion of government workforce reforms after the pandemic, highlighted the importance of international experience as part of developing ICS skills. This diversification of experience is considered vital to increase creativity and productivity in making policies that are responsive to global challenges.

In addition, the use of digital technology in government governance requires ICS who not only master technology, but are also able to utilize this technology to improve public services at the global level. According to the UNESCO report (2022), mastery of digital technology is an important indicator in measuring ICS's readiness to face global challenges.

To ensure ICS is able to face global challenges, structural reform is needed in the public service system. Pollitt and Bouckaert (2017) emphasize the need for public administration reform in the era of globalization which must focus on developing ICS competencies so that they are able to adapt quickly to global changes. These competencies include the ability to communicate across cultures, understanding of international regulations, as well as technological skills that enable ICSs to work efficiently in a global context. Data from a survey conducted by the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) in 2021 shows that countries that have ICS with high international competence tend to be more successful in facing global challenges, such as the health crisis and climate change (OECD, 2021).

Experience in various countries shows examples of success in carrying out public administration reforms. Singapore, for example, has developed an efficient and responsive bureaucratic system, supported by information technology and strong human resource management. According to Koh and Chia (2021), administrative reform in Singapore involves bureaucratic restructuring, the introduction of digital technology, and ongoing training for civil servants. The Singapore government also encourages innovation and creativity among civil servants by providing incentives and rewards for those who successfully develop new initiatives.

South Korea, as a newly developed country, has also successfully carried out public administration reforms. The public administration reforms carried out aim to increase transparency, accountability and efficiency. Kim and Lee (2022) stated that South Korea implements a strict performance evaluation system and promotes public participation in policy making. These reforms also involve the use of information technology to improve the accessibility and transparency of public services.

Apart from these two Asian countries, Australia and Sweden are also carrying out public administration reforms through various increases in the capacity of their employees so that they can compete internationally. Australia focuses on increasing ICS competency through

comprehensive training and development programs. The Australian Public Service Commission report (2023), shows that training programs in Australia are designed to improve leadership, management and technical skills. Australia also encourages ICSs to participate in international exchanges and mentoring programs. Meanwhile, Sweden is carrying out public administration reforms through a participatory approach in public administration. Dahlström and Lapuente (2021), emphasized that Sweden implements a governance model that involves collaboration between government, the private sector and civil society. Reforms in Sweden emphasize the importance of public trust and citizen involvement in the policy-making process.

The best practices above show that successful public administration reform must include elements of technology, transparency and increasing human resource competence. Osborne and Gaebler (1992) emphasize that flexible and innovative approaches in public administration can increase efficiency and responsiveness. Apart from that, Rhodes (1996), also emphasized the importance of collaboration between sectors as the key to successful reform.

In the Indonesian context, bureaucratic structures are often considered complex and slow, which can hinder innovation and efficiency of public services. Complicated bureaucratic structures often cause overlapping functions and responsibilities, which leads to inefficiency. Verheijen et al. (2022), states that structural reform is needed to simplify bureaucratic processes and increase responsiveness to public needs. The reform needed is public administration reform. Public administration reform is an effort to increase efficiency, effectiveness and accountability in government administration. This reform aims to create a bureaucratic system that is more responsive and adaptive to changes in the global environment and societal demands. In Indonesia, administrative reform of the State Civil Apparatus (ICS) is the main focus for strengthening government governance and public services. However, these reforms face various challenges that require clear identification of problems so that they can be addressed with appropriate strategies.

Public administration reform is becoming increasingly important considering Indonesia's strategic position in the Southeast Asia region and its role in various international organizations such as ASEAN, G20, and the UN. A study by Nugroho (2022) shows that to increase international competitiveness, Indonesia needs to develop ICS who are not only competent in carrying out administrative tasks, but also have global insight and skills that are relevant to international dynamics.

Even though there is a lot of potential, ICS in Indonesia faces various challenges in achieving international competence. One of the main challenges is that there is still a rigid bureaucracy and a lack of flexibility in the public administration system. Research conducted by

Setiawan and Wardani (2023) shows that rigid bureaucracy often hinders innovation and adaptation to international best practices (Setiawan & Wardani, 2023).

However, the opportunity to improve ICS competency in Indonesia is also quite large. With the bureaucratic reform program launched by the government, as stated in the 2020-2024 National Medium Term Development Plan (RPJMN), there is a strong commitment to improving the quality of public services and increasing the capacity of ICS through continuous training and education (RPJMN, 2020).

Based on the background above, the problem formulation in this research is:

1. How have public administration reforms been carried out in Indonesia to improve ICS competency at international standards?
2. How can a model be developed that can be applied to improve ICS competency so that it meets international standards?

Methods

This research uses a qualitative approach to explore and analyze public administration reform to produce international standard ICS. A qualitative approach was chosen because it provides an in-depth understanding of social phenomena and the complexity of human interactions in the context of public administration reform and increasing ICS competency. A qualitative approach focuses on in-depth understanding of the meanings, experiences and views of individuals and groups in certain contexts (Creswell, 2014). A qualitative approach also provides social researchers with the opportunity to study phenomena in depth or in more detail (Patton, 2015). In addition, this approach is used to answer research questions that are exploratory and interpretive in nature, such as understanding perceptions, motivations, and factors that influence public administration reform as stated previously.

Data analysis was carried out on various relevant documents, such as government reports, public policies and academic publications related to administrative reform and ICS competency. This document provides the historical and policy context underlying the reforms. The various data available were transcribed and organized to facilitate further analysis. Then, coding is carried out by identifying keywords, phrases, or main ideas in the data that are relevant to the research question. Next, main themes were identified based on coding and analyzed to find patterns and relationships between themes. Finally, an interpretation of the themes that have been identified is carried out in order to gain a deeper understanding of the phenomenon being studied.

Result and Discussion

Public Administration Reform to Realize International Standard ICS Competence

ICS plays a strategic role in administering government and public services. However, Indonesian ICS competencies are often faced with the challenges of globalization and technological developments which demand professionalism and international capabilities. To answer these challenges, public administration reform is one of the key solutions to increase the competence of Indonesian ICS so that they are able to compete internationally.

Public administration reform aims to create an adaptive, responsive and professional bureaucracy in facing global environmental changes. This approach involves system restructuring efforts, improving management, and increasing human resource capacity in the public sector. In the Indonesian context, public administration reform is a government priority to form ICS who are competent, have integrity and are results-oriented, in accordance with the demands of international standards.

Public administration reform in Indonesia began to be intensified since the reform era in the late 1990s, precisely after the 1998 reform era. Various efforts have been made by the government to improve the bureaucratic system which was previously considered slow, inefficient and corrupt. This reform approach includes several important aspects, first, developing ICS competencies through international training and education. In this first approach, the Indonesian government has increased efforts to strengthen ICS competencies through various training and education programs. One of the most significant programs is international cooperation with educational and training institutions abroad. For example, the National Institute of Public Administration (LAN) collaborates with several universities abroad to provide training to ICS in areas that require special skills such as information technology, project management and public policy (LAN, 2021). In addition, Indonesian ICS are also encouraged to take part in scholarship and training programs abroad, such as through the Australia Awards or Chevening Scholarships programs. This program aims to broaden ICS's insight into best practices in other countries and improve their ability to face global challenges.

Second, implementing a meritocracy system in recruitment and promotion. This system is designed to ensure that individuals with the best competence and high integrity will occupy important positions in government. The use of information technology in the ICS selection process, such as the Computer Assisted Test (CAT), is one of the innovations implemented to minimize political interference and corruption in the recruitment process. This meritocracy system is also accompanied by reforms in ICS performance evaluation, where results-based

assessments are increasingly emphasized. This step is expected to increase the accountability and professionalism of ICS, so that they are able to work in accordance with international standards.

However, in several cases, various frauds were still found by various individuals, both in occupying high positions, recruiting ICS candidates and evaluating performance. In selection to occupy certain positions such as echelon I and II, it often happens that the person appointed is not the person who was in rank I at the time the selection was carried out by the Team. Moreover, in regional government, the person appointed is in accordance with the wishes of the regional head, even though the person concerned is third in line. For ICS selection, even though the CAT system is used, it is still suspected that there is fraud committed by certain committee members to pass certain candidates at the interview stage. Meanwhile, regarding ICS performance evaluation using performance-based assessment, it has not been optimal. This is said, because it turns out that there are still many ICSs who are not able to independently prepare employee performance targets (SKP), especially ICSs in the regions.

Third, strengthening technology-based governance. Digitalization in public administration is one of the main pillars of bureaucratic reform in Indonesia. The Indonesian government has indeed launched various initiatives to develop technology-based governance, such as e-government, e-budgeting, and e-procurement. This initiative not only aims to increase efficiency and transparency in public services, but also to strengthen ICS's ability to use information technology to support their duties. The use of digital technology in public administration allows Indonesian ICS to operate more effectively in an increasingly globally connected environment. This also helps ICSs to improve their technological literacy and digital skills, which are very important in facing the Industry 4.0 era.

The problem is, there are limited human resources (HR) who master this field of information technology. The current limited human resources, instead of the government mass recruiting ICS candidates who master the field of information technology, will remain the opposite, namely very limited. In local government this condition is very real. There are even regions that are forced to use honorary employees to work in the information and technology sector. Carrying out education and training for existing employees is indeed possible, but because their scientific background is not in the field of information technology, however, their ability to apply information technology will be very limited.

Based on the description above, it appears that the public administration reforms carried out so far in Indonesia are more about bureaucratic reform. In fact, the scope of public administration reform is very broad, covering various dimensions. Bureaucracy is only one of the various dimensions of public administration that exist, such as public policy, public management,

public organizations, public ethics, public environment, and performance. Bureaucracy is Weber's term for another name for public organizations. When the focus of reform is only at the bureaucratic level, the results will not be optimal. This is because there are still other dimensions that influence it, such as the dimensions of public policy and public management. The success of changing the character of ICS still very much depends on existing policies and how they are managed. For this reason, it is necessary to simultaneously reform the dimensions above, so that ICS is able to compete globally through developing the right model.

If we compare it in various countries, the condition of Indonesian ICS in the context of its ability to compete globally is still very limited. This means that there are ICSs who have gone international, but the percentage is very small. Meanwhile, several countries are already very advanced, such as Singapore, South Korea and Finland.

Singapore is a country that has a public administration system that is considered the best in the world. In recent decades, Singapore has implemented public administration reforms that focus on professionalism, efficiency and integrity. One of the keys to Singapore's success is the implementation of a strict meritocracy system in the recruitment and promotion of civil servants.

In Singapore, civil service are trained to become professionals in their respective fields through international standard training programs. The Singapore government also facilitates civil service to attend further education at world-renowned universities, so that they can adopt the latest knowledge and skills in the field of public administration. This is proven by the quality of public services in Singapore which are very efficient, innovative and results-oriented.

Apart from that, the use of technology in government governance is also highly prioritized. The Singapore government has developed an integrated digital government system, which allows civil servants to work effectively and be responsive to the needs of the community.

Then, South Korea is also known for its innovation and technology-based public administration reforms. This country implements a competency-based civil service recruitment system and uses technology to manage administrative processes more efficiently. In addition, South Korea also emphasizes the importance of innovation in public services by introducing the concept of "Government 3.0," which emphasizes transparency, public participation, and services tailored to individual needs.

In South Korea the civil service is trained to adapt to the latest technology and global changes. The government also provides various international training programs and opportunities for the civil service to study abroad, so they can compare and adopt best practices from other countries.

Things are not much different in Finland. Finland is a country that has the best education system in the world, and this is also reflected in the development of civil service competencies. The Finnish government places great importance on education and training for the civil service, providing continuous development programs focused on improving professional and managerial skills.

Civil service personnel in Finland are given the freedom to develop themselves and take part in training abroad. This allows them to stay abreast of the latest developments in public administration and be able to contribute to innovation in government. This Finnish approach is relevant for Indonesia, especially in terms of developing international training programs for the civil service.

Even though various efforts have been made, Indonesia still faces several challenges in realizing internationally competent ICS. Some of the main challenges include:

First, there is a lack of training support infrastructure. ICS training and development is often limited due to a lack of adequate infrastructure and facilities, especially in remote areas.

Second, budget limitations. Bureaucratic reform requires large investments, both in terms of technology and human resource development. However, budget limitations often become an obstacle in implementing these programs.

Third, resistance to change. Many ICSs are still reluctant to adapt to the changes brought by reform, especially in terms of the use of technology and more flexible work systems.

Development of a Model to Improve ICS Competency at International Standard

Along with global developments, demands for ICS competency are also increasing, especially to ensure that ICS can compete and work to international standards. The ongoing bureaucratic reform in Indonesia emphasizes the importance of developing ICS competencies to achieve international standards in order to face the challenges of the era of globalization and the Industrial Revolution 4.0.

In this context, developing a model to improve ICS competency is very crucial. The model developed should not only focus on improving technical and managerial skills, but also include aspects of digitalization, integrity and innovation.

In this article, we will discuss development models that support the success of public administration reform in Indonesia in order to produce competent and international standard ICS.

1. Strong Political Commitment

One of the key factors that most determines the success of public administration reform is the existence of strong political commitment from the government and state leaders. Political commitment reflects the government's seriousness in making systematic changes in the bureaucracy. Without consistent political commitment, public administration reform will experience obstacles or even fail.

In Indonesia, political commitment to bureaucratic reform has been demonstrated by various presidents and ministers who have made bureaucratic reform one of the main government agendas. For example, the government through the president on various occasions emphasized the importance of bureaucratic reform to create ICSs that are professional and able to compete on the global stage. Through various policies such as bureaucratic simplification, the government is trying to simplify bureaucratic processes and improve the quality of public services.

In addition, the Ministry of State Apparatus Empowerment and Bureaucratic Reform (KemenPAN-RB), emphasized that strong political commitment at the central and regional levels is the main factor in the success of reform. KemenPAN-RB stated that "without strong political commitment, bureaucratic reform will only be a slogan without real implementation in the field" (KemenPAN-RB, 2021).

Apart from the government or regional government side, the People's Representative Council (DPR) and the Regional People's Representative Council (DPRD) are also the keys to the success of increasing ICS capacity. Through budget politics, the DPR and/or DPRD can encourage the government to budget continuously for programs to increase the capacity of ICS to be able to compete globally, either through learning assignments or education and training.

2. Appropriate Public Policy

When the government and DPR or regional government and DPRD have strong political will, the next step is how this is formulated into certain policies. Budget politics, for example, must formulate policies that can accommodate this. A policy that provides every ICS with great opportunities to continue their studies and participate in education and training easily and sustainably. Policy obstacles that require ICS to become permanent employees first or have been permanent employees for 2 years before they can continue their studies must be avoided. Prospective employees should also be given the opportunity to continue their studies. Then, to take part in education and training, it is not only given to certain employees, but must be distributed evenly to every employee.

3. Fair Public Management

This is related to the management and implementation of various policies that have been established to increase the capacity of ICS to reach international standards. The principle of fair distribution is a necessity in increasing the capacity of ICS. Those whose job it is to study or take part in education and training, for example, are not just those close to the leadership, but all of them have the same access and are selected fairly. The aim is for every ICS to have the motivation to increase their capacity.

4. Transformational Leadership

Apart from political commitment, transformational leadership in the bureaucratic environment is also an important factor in the success of public administration reform. Transformational leadership is a type of leadership that is able to inspire, motivate and empower subordinates to achieve positive change and innovation in the organization.

In Indonesia, the role of leaders in the bureaucracy is crucial in creating changes to a work culture that is more open, accountable and results-oriented. ICS are expected to follow the example set by their leaders in terms of integrity, professionalism and commitment to improving public services.

In the context of bureaucratic reform in Indonesia, many leaders have demonstrated transformational leadership through programs to improve performance and increase ICS competency. These leaders act as drivers of change and are able to create a work environment that supports innovation and increases the capacity of ICS. For example, several regional heads in Indonesia succeeded in implementing bureaucratic reform in their regions well because they demonstrated strong and inspiring leadership. Central Java Province, for example, in the last ten years has succeeded in increasing the capacity of ICS and suppressing the behavior of ICS to commit irregularities in office. Even though it is realized, there are still many regional heads who have not done the same thing, and instead are suspected of collecting money by filling certain positions.

5. Meritocracy System in Recruitment and Promotion

Implementing a meritocracy system in the recruitment, placement and promotion of ICS is an important step in creating a bureaucracy that is professional and has integrity. Meritocracy ensures that individuals who occupy strategic positions in government are those who have competence, integrity and good achievements, not based on political connections or patronage.

In Indonesia, implementing a meritocracy system has become one of the main focuses in public administration reform. The ICS recruitment process is carried out through a transparent and accountable competency-based selection system, such as through the CAT (Computer

Assisted Test) test. This system allows ICS selection to be more objective and free from political interference.

The State Civil Service Commission (KICS), emphasized that the application of meritocracy in ICS recruitment in Indonesia has had a positive impact on improving the quality of human resources in the public sector. "The meritocracy system implemented in ICS recruitment has helped create a bureaucracy that is more professional and has integrity, which ultimately improves public services in various sectors" (KICS, 2020).

Apart from that, meritocracy is also applied in the ICS promotion and placement process. By using a results-based performance assessment system, ICSs who excel are given the opportunity to be promoted. This not only motivates ICS to improve their performance, but also creates healthy competition within the bureaucracy.

6. Competency Development Through International Education and Training

To achieve international ICS competency standards, competency development through international education and training is another key factor. ICS need to be given access to international standard education and training so that they can adopt best practices from other countries and apply them in Indonesia.

The Indonesian government has collaborated with various countries and international institutions in providing education and training programs for ICS. For example, ICSs have the opportunity to take part in scholarship programs such as the Australia Awards, Chevening Scholarships, and Fulbright which enable them to study at well-known universities abroad. Apart from that, various technical and managerial trainings are also held in collaboration with international institutions such as the United Nations Development Program (UNDP) and the Asian Development Bank (ADB).

LAN said that the international training program had helped increase the capacity of Indonesian ICS in facing global challenges. LAN notes that "ICSs who take part in international training programs show significant improvements in managerial abilities, technical skills, and understanding of effective public administration practices" (LAN, 2021).

7. Utilization of Digital Technology in Public Administration

In the current digital era, the use of digital technology has become an important factor in public administration reform. Digital technology allows governments to increase efficiency, transparency and accountability in public services. In Indonesia, the use of technology in public administration has become part of reform efforts to create a bureaucracy that is more responsive and adaptive to global technological developments.

The Indonesian government has launched various digital initiatives such as Electronic Based Government Systems (SPBE), e-budgeting, and e-procurement which aim to increase the efficiency of public resource management. This initiative not only helps in increasing accountability and transparency, but also speeds up the public service process so that it is more effective and efficient.

The Ministry of Communication and Information (Kominfo) stated that the use of digital technology in public administration has had a positive impact on the performance of the bureaucracy in Indonesia. "With SPBE, ICS can work more quickly and efficiently, and the public can access public services more easily and transparently" (Kominfo, 2020).

8. Work Culture Oriented to Performance and Innovation

To achieve international standard competency, the Indonesian bureaucracy needs to develop a work culture that is oriented towards performance and innovation. This work culture encourages ICS to always improve the quality of their performance through achieving measurable results and innovation in public services.

In the context of public administration reform in Indonesia, the government has implemented a performance-based assessment system which aims to increase ICS accountability. ICSs who successfully achieve the predetermined performance targets are given awards, while those who do not achieve the targets are given coaching.

The implementation of this performance appraisal system has succeeded in increasing ICS motivation to innovate and achieve better results in their work. "The results-based performance assessment system encourages ICS to focus more on achieving clear and measurable targets, which ultimately improves the quality of public services" (National Bureaucratic Reform, 2021).

9. Public Participation and Transparency

The success of public administration reform is also determined by public participation and transparency in the decision-making process. In the era of democracy and openness of information, the government needs to involve the public in the decision-making process related to public services. Public participation not only increases accountability, but also strengthens the legitimacy of policies taken by the government.

In Indonesia, the government has launched various initiatives to increase public participation and transparency, such as through the People's Online Aspiration and Complaints Service (LAPOR!) platform. This platform allows the public to provide input, complaints and suggestions regarding public services, which are then used as a basis for the government to make improvements.

Transparency International Indonesia (TII), stated that increasing public participation and transparency has made a significant contribution to efforts to reform public administration in Indonesia. "By increasing public participation and transparency, the government can be more responsive to community needs and increase bureaucratic accountability" (TII, 2021).

Conclusion

Developing a model to improve the competence of Indonesian ICS at international standards is a very important effort in realizing a bureaucracy that is professional, responsive and competitive at the global level. The description above shows that to achieve international standards, Indonesian ICS must be equipped with skills, education and training that are in line with global demands. Apart from that, digitalization, meritocracy and innovation are key elements that must be integrated into every aspect of the bureaucracy.

Various countries, such as Singapore, South Korea, and Finland, have succeeded in developing systems that encourage globally recognized ICS competencies through international standard education, implementing meritocracy, and adopting digital technology in public administration. The experiences of these countries provide valuable lessons for Indonesia in designing and implementing ICS development models that suit the needs of the times.

Overall, the ICS development model in Indonesia must place more emphasis on innovation, technological adaptation, international standard education, and a strong meritocracy system to ensure that ICS is able to work to high standards and provide quality public services that are globally competitive.

Based on the description above, there are several policy recommendations that can be implemented to improve the competency of Indonesian ICS to international standards:

1. Increase Investment in International Standard Education and Training

The Indonesian government needs to continue to increase investment in ICS education and training through programs with international standards. This can be done by expanding international cooperation with educational and training institutions abroad. In addition, it is necessary to increase ICS access to international scholarships and training, especially in areas that are very relevant to the digital era and globalization, such as information technology, crisis management and public policy.

2. Strengthening the Meritocracy System in Recruitment and Promotion of ICS

Meritocracy must be consistently enforced in the ICS recruitment and promotion system. The government needs to continue to ensure that every ICS who occupies strategic positions is one who has the best competency and integrity. The use of technology, such as CAT in ICS

selection, must continue to be developed to maintain transparency and accountability in this process. In addition, the performance-based promotion system needs to be strengthened to encourage ICS to improve their performance and achievements.

3. Accelerating Digital Transformation in the Public Administration Sector

The government needs to accelerate digital transformation in the public sector through the development of a more integrated e-government system. ICS must be intensively trained in the use of digital technology, including data management and use of information systems to increase the efficiency and transparency of public services. Digital transformation must also include the provision of adequate technological infrastructure throughout Indonesia, including in remote areas.

4. Encouraging a Culture of Innovation in the ICS Environment

The government needs to create an ecosystem that encourages ICS to innovate in public services. Reward and incentive programs for ICS who are able to create new innovations must be implemented more widely to motivate civil servants to think creatively and create effective solutions. Apart from that, ICS needs to be given space to experiment with new ideas that can improve bureaucratic efficiency and service quality.

5. Increasing International Collaboration in ICS Competency Development

The government needs to expand international cooperation to develop ICS competencies. This collaboration can be carried out with countries that have succeeded in bureaucratic reform and developing ICS competencies, such as Singapore, South Korea and Finland. Through employee exchange programs, educational cooperation and training collaboration, Indonesian ICS can learn from best practices in these countries and apply them in the Indonesian context.

6. Improving the Results-Oriented Performance Appraisal System (Performance-Based)

ICS performance assessments must be more focused on concrete and measurable results. This system allows a more objective evaluation of ICS's contribution to achieving government targets. With a results-oriented assessment system, ICS will be more motivated to achieve achievements and provide better services to the community. This will also simplify the promotion process based on real performance.

References

- Australian Public Service Commission. (2023). *Enhancing skills and competencies of public servants in Australia*. Retrieved from <https://www.apsc.gov.au>.
- Creswell, J. W. (2014). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches (4th ed.)*. SAGE Publications.

- Dahlström, C., & Lapuente, V. (2021). "Collaborative governance in Sweden: Building trust through participation." *Public Management Review*, 23(3), 399-416.
- Friedman, T. L. (2005). *The World is Flat: A Brief History of the Twenty-first Century*. Farrar, Straus and Giroux.
- Kim, J., & Lee, H. (2022). "Bureaucratic transformation in South Korea: Enhancing transparency and accountability." *International Review of Administrative Sciences*, 88(1), 45-62.
- Koh, T., & Chia, S. Y. (2021). "Public administration reform in Singapore: Innovation and best practices." *Journal of Public Administration Research*, 43(2), 215-230.
- Kementerian Pendayagunaan Aparatur Negara dan Reformasi Birokrasi. (2021). *Reformasi Birokrasi Nasional: Kebijakan dan Implementasi*. Jakarta.
- Komisi Aparatur Sipil Negara. (2020). *Laporan Tahunan KASN*. Jakarta.
- Lembaga Administrasi Negara. (2021). *Pengembangan Kompetensi ASN Berstandar Internasional*. Jakarta.
- Nugroho, R. (2022). *Reformasi Birokrasi dan Peningkatan Daya Saing Nasional*. Depok: Universitas Indonesia Press.
- Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development. (2021). *Public Sector Innovation: Learning from International Practices*. OECD Publishing.
- Osborne, D., & Gaebler, T. (1992). *Reinventing government: How the entrepreneurial spirit is transforming the public sector*. Addison-Wesley.
- Patton, M. Q. (2015). *Qualitative research & evaluation methods: Integrating theory and practice (4th ed.)*. SAGE Publications.
- Pollitt, C., & Bouckaert, G. (2017). *Public Management Reform: A Comparative Analysis - Into the Age of Austerity*. Oxford University Press.
- Rhodes, R. A. W. (1996). "The new governance: Governing without government." *Political Studies*, 44(4), 652-667.
- RPJMN. (2020). *Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Menengah Nasional 2020-2024*. Bappenas.
- Setiawan, B., & Wardani, T. (2023). "Birokrasi dan Inovasi di Indonesia: Tantangan dan Peluang". *Jurnal Administrasi Publik*, 14(1), 45-67.
- Transparency International Indonesia. (2021). *Transparansi dalam Birokrasi Indonesia*. Jakarta.
- UNESCO. (2022). *Civil Servant 2.0: Spotighting digital competencies for policymakers at WSIS 2022*. Retrieved from www.unesco.org
- Verheijen, T., Staronova, K., Elghandour, I., & Lefebvre, A.-L. (2022). *Civil Servants and Globalization: Towards an Analytical Framework*. Bristol University Press. <https://doi.org/10.46692/9781529215762.002>

Yip, (2022). *A new breed of public servants: skills and staffing after the pandemic*. Retrieved from www.globalgovernmentforum.com.