The Uniqueness of Managerial Competency Model in Indonesian Districts and Cities

Abstract
Managerial competency is a fascinating field to continue to develop and study until now. UNDP is still formulating the Competency Framework until 2030 (United Nations, 2018). The popularity of this field stems from the flexibility and dynamic nature of organizational practices that have been born due to global development. Managerial competencies have three components: conceptual skills, human resources skills, and technical skills. In Indonesia, city governments find it difficult to determine the right person based on managerial competence, so the wrong person is placed to occupy a strategic position. Therefore, this research wants to determine the right proportion of the three components of managerial competency and their indicators. That was the background of this study: analyzing the proportion of these skills by taking case studies in 2 regions in Indonesia, namely the Tasikmalaya Regency and Serang City. This study sought to find what managerial competency models apply in Indonesia, especially those represented by the two cities/regencies in Indonesia. This study used mixed methods: quantitative methods for distributing questionnaires to Echelon/Class III and IV officials in the two cities and qualitative for expert group discussions to validate that would strengthen the analysis. The time needed for this research is about one year (around February 2019-August 2020). The contribution of this research shows that when an area uses an ideal competency managerial model, it is easier to achieve its vision and mission. The study results indicate that the Tasikmalaya Regency is quite good in its managerial competence selection process. It can be seen from the proportion of the three sets of dynamically dispersed managerial competencies compared to the ideal model, in contrast to Serang City, which is still far from ideal conditions. Serang City must improve its managerial competency model to make it more ideal. This is needed so that organizations can deal with changing times, which tend to be exponential to maximize performance achievements.

Keywords:
managerial competency; conceptual skills; human resources skills; technical skills
Introduction

The Post-Soeharto Era (Reformasi) that began in 1998 significantly impacted the development of regencies and cities in Indonesia. One of the significant impacts is the implementation of regional autonomy (otonomi daerah) in these regencies and cities. With regional autonomy, local governments can manage internal affairs, create development plans according to local needs, and effectively respond to societal needs. Regional autonomy allows local governments to develop their region's potential and optimize existing resources.

In addition to this, these reforms also had a positive impact on the development of infrastructure in regencies and cities in Indonesia. After gaining autonomy, local governments have been able to manage development funds with more flexibility. They can plan and implement infrastructure that aligns with their region's needs, such as constructing roads, bridges, airports, ports, and other public facilities. Adequate infrastructure development is vital in increasing connectivity, expanding accessibility, and driving economic growth in regencies and cities.

The reforms of the Post-Soeharto Era have heavily influenced the economic empowerment of regencies and cities. Through regional autonomy, local governments can formulate policies that support local businesses, provide incentives for investment, and encourage cooperation between the public and private sectors. These steps help create new jobs, increase people's incomes, and reduce regional economic disparities. Thus, these reforms have provided opportunities for regencies and cities in Indonesia to optimize their local economic potential and improve welfare.

However, this is not the case, with several cities and regencies still needing to provide public

Figure 1. The Condition of the Tasikmalaya Regency compared to regions in West Java

Source: Indeks Pembangunan Manusia 2021-2022, Badan Pusat Statistik
services optimally. In this study, we attempt to analyze and compare two regencies/cities in Indonesia, namely the Serang City from the Banten Province and the Tasikmalaya Regency from the West Java Province. The selection of these 2 locations was based on the following conditions:

The Tasikmalaya Regency is a regency located in the east of West Jawa. As can be seen from Figure 1, the Tasikmalaya Regency has a very high percentage of poverty and a high infant mortality rate compared to other regions. On the other hand, the Tasikmalaya Regency has a low IPM (66.84). This is despite good quality human resources and the contribution of MSMEs towards locally generated revenue (pendapatan asli daerah/ PAD). However, the quality of public services still needs to be improved (Figure 1).

Serang City, the capital city of the Banten Province, should have been able to provide excellent public service to their society. However, compared to other regions, Figure 2 shows an average percentage of poverty, while the infant mortality rate is lower than in the Serang Regency and Cilegon City. Serang City also has a low IPM for the provincial capital (72.98). They have good quality human resources and many large industries contributing to the Banten Provinces’ locally generated revenue. Despite this, Serang City still needs to improve when it comes to public services (Figure 2).

Based on the conditions above, raising questions regarding governance errors in internal and external organizations within the two regions would be reasonable. (Dr. Iqbal Amin Khan et al., 2023; Katz, 2000; Mokhtar & Kadri, 2023; Mostafa et al., 2012; Penagos Guzmán & Hernández Castorena, 2023; Razaghi, 2015) argues that a good organization must have three primary managerial skills: conceptual, human resource, and technical. Based on the definition

---

**Figure 2.**

**The Condition of Serang City compared to regions in Banten**

*Source: Indeks Pembangunan Manusia 2021-2022, Badan Pusat Statistik*
of the United Nation ((United Nation, 2018), managerial competence are the skills, attributes, and behaviours considered essential for staff with managerial or supervisory responsibilities. Lack of these skills will result in missed opportunities to improve an organization. Using these three skills emphasizes that good organizations are not born but can be developed. Due to this, recognizing and optimizing the potential of each individual can be a complicated process. Identifying the required skills needed for various aspects of an organization could simplify future selection, training, and promotion processes (Katz, 1974). Over time, the idea of the concept of managerial competence is growing. These researchers have found that the indicators required for each skill are different for each organization, and they are on a consensus of three skills (as shown in Table 1) and detailed explanation of managerial competence as described in Table 2.

The previously mentioned studies regarding managerial competence show the vast scholarship on this particular issue. Many researchers have carried them out. The main consensus among them is the indicators needed for the three primary skills of managerial competence (Conceptual, Human Resource, and Technical). They ((Abdulhasan et al., 2020; Ismail et al., 2022; Savaneviciene & Girdauskiene, 2021; Thanh et al., 2021; Tsendsuren, Yadav, Kim, et al., 2021; Van Vo et al. 2020; Zin et al., 2019) and agree with the opinion of (Katz, 2000) that the proportion of each skill is different depending on the management level. Despite this, only some studies have explained how significant the proportion of expertise for each skill at each management level should be and what general indicators are needed in assessing managerial competence.

This lack of scholarship is the motivation behind this study. The authors wish to see

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Managerial Competencies Requirements</th>
<th>Suggested by</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Conceptual Skill</td>
<td>Abdulhasan et al., 2020; Chen et al., 2020; Dr. Iqbal Amin Khan et al., 2023; Gaigher et al., 2007; Ismail et al., 2022; Manxhari et al., 2017; Maraouch, 2014; Mohd Bekri et al., 2013; Mokhtar &amp; Kadri, 2023; Ogan-Bekiroglu &amp; Arslan, 2014; Paarima et al., 2020; Penagos Guzmán &amp; Hernández Castorena, 2023; Qiao &amp; Wang, 2009; Saleh et al., 2019; Savaneviciene &amp; Girdauskiene, 2021; Strohmeier, 2020; Thanh et al., 2021; Tsendsuren, Yadav, Kim, et al., 2021; Van Vo et al., 2020; Veliu &amp; Manxhari, 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Human Skill</td>
<td>Barney &amp; Wright, 1998; Shirazi &amp; Mortazavi, 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Technical Skill</td>
<td>Al Nahyan et al., 2018; Caliendo, 2020; Krajcovicova et al., 2012; Manxhari et al., 2017; Maraqa et al., 2018; Ogan-Bekiroglu &amp; Arslan, 2014; Veliu &amp; Manxhari, 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mediation between:</td>
<td>Venue: from various sources and analyzed by the author 2023</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
what indicators are suitable and relevant to the Indonesian government and the proportion of skills required for each level of management within these government bodies. This study will take case studies in the Tasikmalaya Regency in West Java and Serang City in the Banten Province to identify an adequate model suitable for Indonesian organizations.

Many studies have been conducted on managerial competency for government, one of which was carried out by the OECD (De Beeck & Hondeghem, 2010; UNDP, 2008), which conducted many studies on managerial competencies at the government level. The oldest and widely used as a reference is the study done by Katz (2000), who, as previously mentioned, argues that an effective organization depends on three basic skills (see Figure 3): technical (Andereggen et al., 2022; Bennett & Williams, 2022; Dai & Liang, 2022; Uoshima et al., 2021; Webb, 2021), human resources (Alamer, 2021; Caliendo, 2020; Iramaneerat, 2008; Rhodes, 2018; Srikanth & Jomon, 2015; Strohmeier, 2020; Subramony, 2009; Troutman, 2020; Webb, 2021), and conceptual (Chen et al., 2020; Mohd Bekri et al., 2013; Ogan-Bekiroğlu & Arslan, 2014; Strohmeier, 2020). Administrators require (a) adequate technical skills to complete their assigned tasks, (b) adequate human skills in teamwork to participate and lead a group, and (c) sufficient conceptual skills to recognize the interrelationships of the various factors of an organization, which will provide insight into decision-making skills for the organization they are a part of.

As seen in Figure 3, top management must emphasize conceptual skills, followed by human resource and technical skills. Middle management puts more emphasis on these three skills. First-line management is the opposite of top management, emphasizes technical skills, and is followed by conceptual and human resource skills. If the proportions of this concept have yet to be achieved, an organization should consider educational programs for future management selection processes (Dr. Iqbal Amin Khan et al., 2023; Katz, 2000; Mokhtar & Kadri, 2023; Mostafa et al., 2012; Penagos Guzmán & Hernández Castorena, 2023; Razaghi, 2015).

In his 1974 article in the Harvard Business Review titled Leadership Development: Skill

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2. A Summary of Indicators of Managerial Competency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Managerial Competency</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conceptual Skill</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thinking Analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thinking Flexibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conceptual Thinking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Think Analytical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intelligence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analytical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: from various sources and analyzed by the author 2023
Robert L. Katz classifies three primary skills a manager requires: conceptual skills, human resources skills, and technical skills (Katz, 1974, 2000). Now, it continues to be widely used as a reference by researchers in the field of managerial competence (Abdulhasan et al., 2020; Ismail et al., 2022; Thanh et al., 2021; Tsenduren, Yadav, Kim, et al., 2021; Van Vo et al., 2020). They argue that the proportion of these three skills for the three levels of management (top, middle, and first-level) must be balanced and complementary to one another. This approach emphasizes that good organizations are not born but can be developed. Despite this, identifying the potential of each individual in an organization can take time and effort. Developing methods to identify the skills most needed at various levels of management could prove helpful in the selection, training, and promotion processes going forward. The following is an in-depth description of each skill within managerial competence:

a. Conceptual Skills

One of the primary skills of managerial competency is conceptual skills. These could also be referred to as perceptual skills, analytical skills, skills based on general understanding, theoretical skills, or cognitive skills. Skills based on general understanding refer to the ability to consider the capabilities of various parts of an organization as a unified whole. A manager must recognize how an organization’s functions are interdependent, and any changes in one part will affect others. These skills can be expanded to understand internal and cross-organizational relations in general and sociopolitical and socioeconomic contexts. By recognizing these relationship patterns, management can act effectively and efficiently, increasing organizational performance (Chen et al., 2020; Gaigher et al., 2007; Katz, 2000; Mohd Bekri et al., 2013; Ogan-Bekiroğlu & Arslan, 2014; Robbins et al., 2014; Strohmeier, 2020).

b. Human Resource Skills

This refers to understanding, motivating, and working with others. Katz describes human resource skills as the capability to work effectively within a team while building an understanding of others and learning how to collaborate and take the initiative (Alamer, 2021; Caliendo, 2020; Iramaneerat, 2008; Katz, 2000; Maraouch, 2014;
c. Technical Skills

Technical skills relate to understanding and mastering a particular activity involving methods, processes, procedures, or techniques. Technical skills involve specific knowledge and analytical skills of particular expertise that require certain tools and techniques. In other words, this skill, in particular, is particular, and managers who are developing their technical skills require much experience (Bennett & Williams, 2022; Dai & Liang, 2022; Katz, 2000; Robbins et al., 2014; Uoshima et al., 2021).

Studies conducted by (Manxhari et al., 2017; Veliu & Manxhari, 2017), as well as (Abdulhasan et al., 2020; Ismail et al., 2022; Savaneviciene & Girdauskiene, 2021; Van Vo et al., 2020; Veliu & Manxhari, 2017), are in line with arguments from (Abdulhasan et al., 2020; Katz, 1974, 2000; Savaneviciene & Girdauskiene, 2021; Tsendsuren, Yadav, Han, et al., 2021; Van Vo et al., 2020; Zin et al., 2019). They state that, generally, the strengthening of the theoretical model assumes that managerial competency’s most crucial characteristic is to mediate between professional and personal business performance. The results of this study show that aspects of managerial competence influence organizational performance. This study, in particular, was conducted on SMEs in Kosovo. The study examined the managerial competence and organizational performance of small and medium-sized companies (SMEs). They conclude that a combination of several managerial competencies (professional, social, and personal) did impact the performance of SMEs in Kosovo. This is also in line with a study done by (Ismail et al., 2022; Peterson & Van Fleet, 2004; Veliu & Manxhari, 2017), who point out that managerial competence skills have an impact on improving management performance, which helps organizations to achieve their goals.

Literature on managerial competence is a broad field of study that has received more attention in recent years. This can be heavily attributed to globalization, which, like most things, has substantially impacted management skills development. Despite this, the effects of globalization are a double-edged sword as some managers have been able to capitalize on its advantages while others have yet to. An interesting question arises from this situation: What causes some managers to succeed and others to fail? Many of today’s progressive organizations use the managerial competency model to describe critical skills and behaviours they want to see at each management level. Managerial competency models can provide a structured framework for defining and developing behaviours that significantly impact organizational performance. Identification and development of managerial competencies is an essential human resource management tool to achieve an organization’s strategic goals. This allows managers to pinpoint the value of the managerial competency model and its application (Dr. Iqbal Amin Khan et al., 2023; Mokhtar & Kadri, 2023; Penagos Guzmán & Hernández Castorena, 2023; Veliu & Manxhari, 2017).

The managerial competency model can describe specific combinations of knowledge, skills, and other personality characteristics that are necessary for the efficient execution of tasks in an organization. Managerial competencies are flexible and must be adapted to the needs of an organization. (Dr. Iqbal Amin Khan et al., 2023; Mokhtar & Kadri, 2023; Mostafa et al., 2012; Penagos Guzmán & Hernández Castorena, 2023; Razaghi, 2015) stated that each set of managerial competencies only partially reflects the role of a manager because each activity requires specific competencies. This impacts the effectiveness of a particular role. Nyhan also notes that certain generalizations of managerial competence are basing their arguments on the work of Fayol.
(Rodrigues, 2001), who thought that managerial work and similar roles have four categories: planning, organization, coordination, and control. The competencies needed by managers depend on whether they are on the operational, tactical, or strategic level. As such, it is imperative to develop managerial competencies at various levels. A successful organization is an organization where human resources have the necessary competencies to conduct business and fulfill an organization's strategic goals ((Mokhtar & Kadri, 2023; Veliu & Manxhari, 2017).

Although the three sets of managerial competencies are generally agreed upon, there still needs to be more debate regarding the indicators by which each skill can be assessed. Despite this, Katz heavily emphasized the importance of these skills and argued that their approaches are only sometimes born but developed. Thus, a robust strategy is needed to better develop the skills approach to identify the required skills at every management level.

Studies have shown that there are priorities within each skill. For example, the essential practice of conceptual skills is paying attention to strategic and long-term goals and cultivating an awareness of rules and regulations. Other examples include the need for effective communication for human resource skills and the delegation of rights and responsibilities of technical skills. Creating a plan considering each skill's priority can increase an organization's effectiveness and efficiency ((Ismail et al., 2022; Mokhtar & Kadri, 2023; Paarima et al., 2020; Penagos Guzmán & Hernández Castorena, 2023; Savaneviciene & Girdauskiene, 2021; Tsendsuren, Yadav, Han, et al., 2021; Tsendsuren, Yadav, Kim, et al., 2021; Van Vo et al., 2020)).

A practical example would be selecting a manager, where the selection process would not only be based on competency but also on the potential contribution of the manager towards an organization. Here, managerial skill is framed within the context of the competitiveness between potential employees. They elaborate on this point in their study of the physical education office at a university in Iran. They found that human resource skills stood out compared to conceptual and technical skills (Alamer, 2021; Maraouch, 2014; Mostafa et al., 2012; Troutman, 2020).

The point of contention among scholars is that a formula that can be used to measure organizational success based on managerial competence alone has yet to be developed. This raises the question: Why do some organizations perform better than others? The answer is that individuals in successful organizations have the required skills to perform their job well. Krajcovicova et al. (2012) agree with this point and elaborate that the competency model shows specific combinations of knowledge, skills, and other personality characteristics that are necessary for the efficient execution of tasks in an organization. Competence in a model can be set in various formats ((Al Nahyan et al., 2018; Caliendo, 2020; Dai & Liang, 2022; Manxhari et al., 2017; Marqa et al., 2018)).

After further development of the competency model, several integration models can measure the maturity of managerial competence. There are three dimensions: vertical integration, horizontal integration and the integration of managerial competency implementation. Research conducted by the United Nations (UN) in 2009 assessed the maturity level of management competencies associated with the three previously mentioned dimensions. Although all member states are committed to these three dimensions of integration, only some have been able to adopt this holistic approach to competency management. This is often due to difficulties maintaining organizational strategies (vertical integration) and needing HR's role in competency management (horizontal integration). The main problem lies in the third dimension, or implementing management competencies throughout the organization.
Member countries from the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) have experienced difficulties applying a universally developed HR guideline within their agencies, departments or ministries. Apart from the push from the central government, there is an evident variation of interpretation between agencies, departments or ministries that can be seen from their degree of difference and boldness in their application. France is an extreme example, as management competencies depend almost entirely on ministries. Furthermore, managerial competencies should be reviewed continuously to identify gaps between competency models and an organization's needs.

In the Netherlands, the Dutch government argues that the future of managerial competence depends on management's interest in the internal needs of an organization. Managerial competencies tend to have a specific period and will continue to change over time ((Horton, 2010; Kickert, 1997; Van Hoogen & Tackney, 2022)).

Another example can be seen in the United Kingdom (UK), where the British government received harsh criticism concerning its civil service. These criticisms include a lack of staff understanding, commitment from line management, a lack of ownership and supervision from senior management, difficulties in using and implementing competency frameworks, resistance from the workers union and management, and delays in implementing frameworks. Aside from this, the lack of clarity in work processes is most concerning, which means that these processes are "too complex to construct, too difficult to measure and too subjective" ((Horton, 2010; Rauseo et al., 2019; Samra-Fredericks, 2000; Sullivan & Bottomley, 1991)). Management integration in the UK's central government (horizontal and vertical) has yet to occur.

Regarding the future of managerial competence in the UK, there are some indications of a tendency to prioritize knowledge and skills over organizational behaviour ((Horton, 2010; Rauseo et al., 2019; Samra-Fredericks, 2000; Sullivan & Bottomley, 1991)). We can also see the beginnings of managerial competencies in Brazil, which has already begun implementing them in its selection processes. Meanwhile, Australian companies are more advanced, marked by strengthening managerial competencies.

Competency management is often seen as an integrative instrument to maintain coherence in facilitating command systems in a decentralized public sector. The successful implementation of consistent and unambiguous competency-based management requires three dimensions of integration within an organization (vertical integration, horizontal integration, and implementation) and a high level of maturity in competency management (De Beeck & Hondeghem, 2010). In the case of vertical integration, it is essential to emphasize the relationship between the achievement of organizational goals and competencies. Furthermore, competency models are best utilized when all HR activities are integrated. Thinking in terms of competence should be a way of life in organizations, from planning to selecting employees to guiding and rewarding employee performance. This does not only require an alignment of strategies (vertical integration) and HR systems (horizontal integration) but alignment and integration with managerial competencies ((Iwashita, 2023; Liu et al., 2023; Schwarz et al., 2023; Sethi et al., 2023)).

Vertical integration can be formed in several ways. In Australia, for example, public service values shape the relationship between organizational objectives and various capability frameworks. The Korean government has a common practice where five-year work plans of ministries and government bodies must ensure a direct and dynamic link between strategy and competence. In general, the vertical or horizontal integration level remains highly dependent.
on the actual implementation and practice of managerial competence in several institutions or departments. This brings us to the third dimension of integration: implementation within an organization ((Budjanovcanin & Guest, 2023; Cheng et al., 2023; De Beeck & Hondeghem, 2010; Jaga & Guetterman, 2023; Strohmeier, 2020; Zhang et al., 2023; Zhou & Zheng, 2023)).

It is this third dimension that is very crucial to the public due to its unique organizational structure. In many cases, they create a particular unit (in central and regional organizations) to ensure the integration of this third dimension. Despite this, the friction and disconnect between central and decentralized organizations can cause problems with this third dimension of integration. This will lead to several contradictions: The organizational structure of the public sector should be able to promote integration. However, the contents of this structure indirectly create disintegration ((af Malmborg & Trondal, 2023; Fleischer & Pruin, 2023; Klimas et al., 2023; Penagos Guzmán & Hernández Castorena, 2023; Schwarz et al., 2023; Stegehuis et al., 2023)).

Methods

This research was conducted using the mixing method of Echelon/Class III and Echelon/Class IV officials in the Tasikmalaya Regency in West Java and Serang City in the Banten Province, where a quantitative element is needed to see the tendency of respondents’ answers to the questions asked regarding managerial competency on a scale of suitability. Then, the qualitative elements are validated through table group discussions, which align with Maxwell’s opinion (Maxwell, 2010) (see Figure 4). The selection of the locus for Tasikmalaya Regency and Serang City, considering that Serang City is a city that has recently been formed in Banten Province but is strategically located towards the centre of power. Then, the election for Tasikmalaya Regency because this district has received quite a lot of awards (focusjabar.id/2023/07/27/ade-sugianto-call-call-prestasi-di-hari-jadi-kabupaten-tasikmalaya/) and is considered representative of West Java Province.

The questionnaire addressed the discussion of managerial competencies based on the previously mentioned theories (see Table 2, and it was tailored to comply with Indonesian laws and regulations (Regulation Of The Head Of The State Personnel Agency (Number: 7, Year 2013, Date Of Issue: 11 February 2013), ensuring its suitability for the Indonesian context. In these respective regencies and cities, the number of indicators and questions may vary due to each region’s distinctive socio-political characteristics and geographical conditions. This allowance is permissible if it aligns with the competency items specified in the Regulations Of The Head Of The State Personnel Agency (Number: 7, Year 2013, Date Of Issue: 11 February 2013). Moreover, the proposed competency items have been communicated to the regional leaders at the level of regents and mayors.

After distributing questionnaires, research validation was carried out by conducting expert group discussions. During this stage, all Echelon/Classes gathered to conduct a table group
discussion on a particular theme. The researchers observed the interactions of the participants in this group and re-assessed the three managerial competency skills (conceptual, human resources, technical skills) among participants. The results from the assessment of questionnaires were then combined with the assessment from the group discussion. They were used to determine the final score for all Echelon/Class III and IV officials.

a. The Tasikmalaya Regency, West Java

For the Tasikmalaya Regency, a test was conducted to measure managerial competence using around 12 Skill Indicators. The considerations for using these 12 indicators were adjusted to the characteristics and conditions within the government of the Tasikmalaya Regency. Each indicator is supported by around 9 - 10 questions, leading to 120 questions in the questionnaires distributed to all Echelon/Class III and IV officials within the Tasikmalaya Regency. These 12 questions were related to the process of managerial skills, particularly conceptual skills, human resource skills, technical skills and other factors. 706 respondents were Echelon/Class III and IV officials. Further details can be seen in Figure 5.

As mentioned prior, there were a total of 120 questions; each indicator consisted of 10 questions. The details of the indicators can be seen in Table 3, where the distribution consists of conceptual skills (2 indicators), HR skills (5 indicators), technical skills (2 indicators), and other factors (2 indicators).

b. Serang City, Banten Province

A test was also conducted to assess Serang City's managerial competencies using approximately 16 Skill indicators. The use of these 16 indicators was also tailored to the characteristics and conditions of the Serang City government. More indicators were used in comparison to the Tasikmalaya Regency. However, each indicator is only supported by around 3-4 questions (less than the Tasikmalaya Regency), so there are a total of 45 questions distributed through questionnaires for Echelon/Class III and IV officials in Serang City. These 3 to 4 questions will be related to the process of managerial skills, particularly conceptual skills, human resource skills, technical skills and other factors. 440 respondents were Echelon/Class III and IV officials, with details as shown in Figure 6.

From the 45 questions, each indicator consisted of around 3 to 4 questions. The details of the indicators can be seen in Table 4, where the distribution consists of conceptual skills (3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 3. Indicators of Managerial Competency in the Tasikmalaya Regency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Managerial Competency</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conceptual Skill</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Flexibility of Thought</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Analytical Capacity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Resources Skill</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Self-control</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Teamwork</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Empathy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical Skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Data/Information Collection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Awareness towards Regulation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Organizational Commitment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** from various sources and analyzed by the author 2023
The Uniqueness of Managerial Competency Model in Indonesian Districts and Cities

248

indicators), HR skills (7 indicators), technical skills (3 indicators), and other factors (3 indicators).

Results and Discussion

I. The Tasikmalaya Regency

Based on data processed from around 704 Echelon/ Class III and IV officials (see Figure 5 Number of Echelon/ Class and Classes), the distribution of data from questionnaires and group discussions is shown in the table below (Table 5), which summarizes the average of each skill indicator for each managerial competency. As seen in Table 5, the average of each indicator is from the highest to the lowest. Each skill in this managerial competence is discussed in different parts to ensure a more comprehensive analysis.

Table 4.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Managerial Competency</th>
<th>Conceptual Skill</th>
<th>Human Resources Skill</th>
<th>Technical Skills</th>
<th>Others</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

7. Verbal Communication
8. Guidance
9. Written Communication
10. The Development of Others

Source: from various sources and analyzed by the author 2023

The description for each colour is as follows: **green** indicates the highest average value, and **orange** indicates the lowest average value.

![Figure 6. Details of Echelon/ Class in Serang City, Banten Province](image)

We can see from Table 5 that three indicators of conceptual skills: (1) flexibility of thought, (2) planning, and (3) analytical capacity is heavily dominated by officials of Echelon/ Class III.A. Only one indicator is dominated by Echelon/ Class III.B.: the flexibility of thought. These results are ideal where the distribution of conceptual skills has higher values in Echelon/ Class III.A. This means that by order of highest to lowest average value, start from Echelon/ Class IIIA,
If we average the indicators from the three conceptual skills, we can see the results displayed in Figure 7. It can be seen that Echelon/Class III.A has a higher mastery of these skills, followed by Echelon/Class III.B and Echelon/Class IV. Thus, the average distribution of conceptual skills is ideal.

### b. Human Resources Skills

For human resource skills, ideally, each level (or, in this case, Echelon/Class) should be similar in terms of average value due to the indicators of human resource skills revolving around the social skills of management. Based on data processed from around five indicators (see Table 5), the middle level (Echelon/Class III.B) should have the highest average. However, out of 5 indicators, two were dominated by Echelon/Class III.A: leadership (3,567) and organization (3,507). Interestingly, empathy (5,013) has a higher value in Echelon/Class IV and the smallest value in Echelon/Class III.A. Ideally, the five indicators should be evenly distributed at each job level, with not too much deviation. It can be ascertained that human resources skills development needs to be improved.

Table 5.
Recapitulation of the Average of Indicators for each Skill of Managerial Competence in the Tasikmalaya Regency

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Managerial Competency</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Echelon/Class</th>
<th>Average</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>III.A</td>
<td>III.B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conceptual Skills</td>
<td>1-Flexibility of Thought</td>
<td>4.119</td>
<td>4.313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1-Planning</td>
<td>3.955</td>
<td>3.656</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1-Analytical Capacity</td>
<td>3.567</td>
<td>3.188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>HR Skills</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2-Empathy</td>
<td>5.672</td>
<td>3.137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2-Self-control</td>
<td>5.572</td>
<td>3.013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2-Teamwork</td>
<td>4.164</td>
<td>3.779</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2-Leadership</td>
<td>3.567</td>
<td>3.531</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2-Organization</td>
<td>3.507</td>
<td>3.031</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>HR Skills</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3-Data/Information Collection</td>
<td>1.284</td>
<td>1.604</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3-Tenacity</td>
<td>1.418</td>
<td>1.521</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Other Factors</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4-Awareness towards Regulations</td>
<td>3.866</td>
<td>3.740</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4-Organizational Commitment</td>
<td>3.552</td>
<td>3.646</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Research results, 2023

Figure 7.
Distribution of Means and Percentages - Conceptual Skills for Each Echelon/Class in the Tasikmalaya Regency

Source: research results, 2023

If we average the indicators from the three conceptual skills, we can see the results displayed in Figure 7. It can be seen that Echelon/Class III.A has a higher mastery of these skills, followed by Echelon/Class III.B and Echelon/Class IV. Thus, the average distribution of conceptual skills is ideal.

then Echelon/Class III.B and so on. In regards to conceptual skills, data shows that it is already sufficient. If any improvements were to be made, they should focus on the flexibility of thought dominated by Echelon/Class III.B.
analyzing these averages of human capital skills. Figure 8 shows the average value of the five human resource skill indicators. It can be seen that Echelon/Class III.A and III.B have an equal average score of 4.10 points, followed by Echelon/Class IV. Ideally, the distribution of human resource skills at each level should be similar or almost equal, whereas conceptual and technical skills should have varying values. The collected data shows that there must be improvements in human research skills at Echelon/Class IV.B so that the values stay consistent with the level above, particularly for the indicators of empathy, self-control and cooperation.

c. Technical Skills

For the two indicators of technical skills, their values should ideally be dominated by first-line management (Echelon/Class IV.B). Based on the results of the analysis, it can be seen that the mean of the two indicators, specifically the data/information collecting indicator (2.188) and the tenacity indicator (1.849), is dominated by Echelon/Class IV.B. Here, technical skills have been optimally executed in the values of the two key indicators for technical skills are indeed dominated by Echelon/Class IV.B and gradually reduce towards Echelon/Class III.A.

The figure above (Figure 9) displays each Echelon/Class's average distribution of technical skills. The average value of this distribution was obtained by averaging all the indicators of technical skills. Here, we can see that technical skills have successively been dominated by first-line management (Echelon/Class IV), then middle management (Echelon/Class III.B) and finally top management (Echelon/Class III.A). Based on these results, technical skills have triumphed over other skills.

d. Other Factors

In addition to the three skills measured above, the researchers also tried to measure...
other necessary factors to boost regional potential. This other factor uses two additional indicators, including awareness towards regulation (4,460), surprisingly dominated by Echelon/ Class IV, and organizational commitment (3,646), which Echelon/ Class III.B dominates. For both indicators, the distribution of mean values cannot be deemed ideal due to the difference in values (deviation) being too high between job levels.

After presenting these values, the researchers try to average each skill for each level. The results are exciting and show a somewhat even distribution of values, although human resource skills have the highest value (See Figure 10).

![Figure 10. The Average Distributions for Every Skill for Each Echelon/ Class in the Tasikmalaya Regency](Source: research results, 2023)

Figure 10 shows the diagonal distribution of skills. This shows that although the values of each skill could be better when compared to Figure 3, there is potential for these skills to improve and become ideal. Due to this, the researchers were interested in seeing the conditions behind the values and distribution of percentages of each skill. The results show that conceptual, HR and technical skills tend to differ in mean values (Figure 11). Due to this, in the Tasikmalaya Regency, the managerial competence of each Echelon/ Class is close to meeting ideal conditions. This follows the opinion of (Abdulhasan et al., 2020; Ismail et al., 2022; Savaneviciene & Girdauskiene, 2021; Tsendsuren, Yadav, Han, et al., 2021; Tsendsuren, Yadav, Kim, et al., 2021), who stated that the proportion of managerial competencies for the top level (Echelon/ Class III.A) should prioritize conceptual skills, then HR and technical skills. Conversely, the first-line management level should be dominated by technical skills with a small percentage of conceptual and HR skills. The Tasikmalaya Regency must make more efforts to develop ideal conditions for the distribution of competency at each level so that effectiveness and efficiency in achieving the goals held by the organization can quickly be achieved.

![Figure 11. The Percentages of Average Distributions of Every Skill for Each Echelon/ Class in the Tasikmalaya Regency](Source: Research results, 2023)

II. Serang City

Based on data collected from around 440 Echelon/ Class III and IV officials (see Figure 6 Details of Echelon/ Class Officials and their Positions), the distribution of data from the questionnaires and group discussions is recapitulated with the average of each skill indicator for each managerial Competency in Table 6. The average is then sorted by indicator from the highest to the lowest. The discussion of each skill in this managerial competence is discussed in different parts to ensure a more comprehensive analysis.
The Uniqueness of Managerial Competency Model in Indonesian Districts and Cities

252

a. Conceptual Skills

Table 6 shows the distribution of conceptual skills and their indicators: (1) analytical capacity, (2) planning and (3) conceptual capacity. Here, the indicators are dominated by Echelon/Class III.B rather than by Echelon/Class III.A that should ideally have the highest value. This means that the average value put in a sequence should be more significant for Echelon/Class III.A, then Echelon/Class III.B and so on. Despite this, as previously mentioned, Figure 12 shows that the processes of analysis, planning and conceptual thinking are the basis for occupying top-level management positions (Echelon/Class III.A). The communication pattern between the Echelon/Classes and those below them must be improved, making it challenging to achieve organizational goals.

b. Human Resources Skills

The proportion of human resource skills should ideally be lower than conceptual skills. Based on data collected from around seven indicators (see Table 6), the middle level (Echelon/Class III.B) should have the highest average. Of the seven indicators, 5 of them were dominated by Echelon/Class III.A, particularly

---

**Table 6. Recapitulation of the Average of Indicators for each Skill of Managerial in Serang City**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Managerial Competency</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Echelon/Class</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>III A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1-Planning</td>
<td>4.100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2-The Development of Others</td>
<td>4.725</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2-Organization</td>
<td>4.075</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2-Verbal Communication</td>
<td>3.800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2-Written Communication</td>
<td>4.100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3-Data/Information Collection</td>
<td>4.450</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Technical Skills</td>
<td>3-Quality Oriented</td>
<td>4.175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3-Service Oriented</td>
<td>4.250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4-Organizational Commitment</td>
<td>4.375</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Other Factors</td>
<td>4-Integrity</td>
<td>4.400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4-Response to Cultural Influence</td>
<td>4.500</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Research results, 2023

The description for each colour is as follows: green indicates the highest average value, and orange indicates the lowest average value.

---

**Figure 12. The Average Distributions of Conceptual Skills for Each Echelon/Class in Serang City**

Source: research results, 2023
the indicators of the development of others (4,725), guidance (4,375), organization (4,075), verbal communication (3,800) and written communication (4,100). Only two indicators, cooperation (4,745) and leadership (4,209,) were dominated by Echelon/ Class III.B. Despite this, Echelon/ Class III.B. should have dominated the seven indicators. From this data, human resource skills require further development.

Figure 13.
The Average Distributions of Human Resource Skills for Each Echelon/ Class in Serang City

Source: research results, 2023

It can be seen from Figure 13 that the average value of all human resources skill indicators was Echelon/ Class III.A has the highest value (4.22), then Echelon/ Class III.B (4.13) and finally, Echelon/ Class IV.A (3.87). Ideally, the values for each Echelon/ Class should be evenly distributed or, in other words, have limited deviations of values. This indicates that human resource skills are being implemented optimally. However, Figure 13 shows that Echelon/ Class III.A has the highest value, and the conditions are far from expectations (see Figure 3).

c. Technical Skills

For technical skills with three indicators, it is ideal that a more significant proportion is dominated by the first-line management level (Echelon/ Class IV.B). However, based on the analysis results, it can be seen from the average of the three indicators, two of which are dominated by Echelon/ Class III.A (see Table 6), these include data/ information collection (4,450) and quality-oriented (4,175). The remaining indicator, service-oriented (4,227), was dominated by Echelon/ Class III.B. These conditions can be detrimental, considering that the top and middle management levels control and carry out more technical work than first-line management (Echelon/ Class IV). This can cause an organization to disregard the technical level because all work is carried out by the top and middle management (Echelon/ Class IIIA.III.B). Because of this, improvements at the technical skill level must be carried out as soon as possible to create balance in the process of delegating tasks and responsibilities based on competence.

Figure 14.
The Average Distributions of Technical Skills for Each Echelon/ Class in Serang City

Source: Research results, 2023
The average analysis of all indicators in Figure 14 shows similar results. Here, Echelon/Class IV.A should have the highest score, not Echelon/Class III.A. In terms of technical skill, ideally, first, line management (Echelon/Class IV.A) should have a more significant proportion of value, followed by middle management (Echelon/Class III.V) and top management (Echelon/Class III.A).

d. Other Factors

In addition to the three skills measured above, the researchers also tried to measure other necessary factors to boost regional potential. These other factors include three additional indicators: organizational commitment (4,491) dominated by Echelon/Class III.B, integrity (4,400) and response to cultural influence (4,500) (Qiao & Wang, 2009).

After analyzing these two regions, the researchers tried to average each skill for each level. The results highlight that the average values are spread evenly, although technical skills have the highest average value (see Figure 15).

**Figure 15.** The Average Distributions for Every Skill for Each Echelon/Class in Serang City

Source: research results, 2023

Based on Figure 15, the distribution of values is relatively even. Despite this, if we conduct further analysis using a 100% scale, the results show that conceptual, HR and technical skills tend to have similar values (Figure 16). Thus, for the City of Serang, the value of each skill at each Echelon/Class does not deviate. This is far from being in line with theory, which states that the proportion for the top level (Echelon/Class III.A) must prioritize conceptual skills, then HR and technical skills. First-line management should have opposite priorities and prioritize technical skills over conceptual and HR skills. Figure 18 clearly shows results that could be better compared to the conditions in Figure 3.

The City of Serang should improve the distribution of competencies for each level to create balance in the work processes, ultimately resulting in effectiveness and efficiency that can later be used to achieve organizational goals.

**Figure 16.** The Percentages of Average Distributions of Every Skill for Each Echelon/Class in Serang City

Source: Research results, 2023

Finally, the models of managerial competence in Tasikmalaya district and Serang City are different and tend to be far from the ideal model, which has been a concept for a long time (Figure 17). The City of Serang must put more effort towards an ideal model when compared to Tasikmalaya Regency, which is already looking towards an ideal model.

**Conclusion**

Based on the results and analysis, if we compare the ideal model of managerial competence
(see Figure 3) with the models that were produced from studies in two cities/regencies in Indonesia (as shown in Figure 17), we can conclude that the model in the two cities/regencies in Indonesia that the Tasikmalaya Regency and Serang City represented were not ideal. In the Tasikmalaya Regency, the diagonal pattern of value distribution can potentially lead to an ideal condition. However, the deviation percentage values for each skill indicator are insignificant for each Echelon/Class skill. This is considered sufficient compared to the managerial competency model in Serang City. The distribution of values for each skill at each level had little deviation. If Serang City wishes to better their performance, then improvements should be made to effectively and efficiently fulfil its goals.

Another conclusion is that when an area implements the ideal concept of competency management, the tendency to achieve the vision and mission of the organization can be easier because the concept of competency management is the concept of placing the right people in appropriate and clear positions that will greatly affect the performance of organizations and institutions. Based on the research results on these 2 loci, it can be seen that government institutions are still not ideal in implementing this concept. For the private sector it tends to be ideal and easier to follow. There are many factors that cause the implementation in the private sector and government to be different, one of which is the aspect of leadership and flexibility which is different from the private sector. Hence, the government needs more time to adapt.

References


Houser, L.A.C. (2013). Perceptions of undergraduate students and faculty regarding the impact of electronic communication on the written-communication skills of undergraduate students. In *Dissertation Abstracts International Section A: Humanities and Social Sciences, 73*(9), A(E)).


Rhodes, A. L. (2018). Effects of a collaboratively developed peer mediated intervention on the social communication skills of students with complex communication needs in inclusive classroom settings. Dissertation Abstracts International Section A: Humanities and Social Sciences, 78(7-A(E)).


The Uniqueness of Managerial Competency Model in Indonesian Districts and Cities


The Regulations Of The Head Of The State Personnel Agency (Number: 7, Year 2017, Date Of Issue: 11 February 2017)